POLICIES AND PRACTICES

132

Impact of Climate Change on Nomads in Jammu and Kashmir with a View of Public Health Facilities



December 2022



Policies and Practices 132 December 2022

Published by: Mahanirban Calcutta Research Group IA-48, Sector-III, Ground Floor Salt Lake City Kolkata-700097 India Web: http://www.mcrg.ac.in

ISSN 2348 0297

Printed by: Graphic Image New Market, New Complex, West Block 2nd Floor, Room No. 115, Kolkata-87

This publication is brought out with the support of the Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung. It is a part of the research programme of the Calcutta Research Group on migration and forced migration. It is conducted in collaboration with Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung, Institute of Human Science, Vienna, and Several Universities and Institution in India.

The Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung (RLS) is a German-based foundation working in South Asia and other parts of the world on the subjects of critical social analysis and civic education. It promotes a sovereign, socialist, secular, and democratic social order, and aims at present members of society and decision-makers with alternative approaches to such an order. Research organisations, groups working for self-emancipation, and social activists are supported in their initiatives to develop models that have the potential to deliver social and economic justice. The work of Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung, South Asia can be accessed at www.rosalux.in.

Sponsored by the Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung with funds of the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development of the Federal Republic of Germany. This publication or parts of it can be used by others for free as long as they provide a proper reference to the original publication. The content of the publication is the sole responsibility of the partner and does not necessarily reflect a position of RLS.

Impact of Climate Change on Nomads in Jammu and Kashmir with a View of Public Health Facilities

Pallavi Sareen

2022

Impact of Climate Change on Nomads in Jammu and Kashmir with a View of Public Health Facilities

Pallavi Sareen^{*}

"We are blessed with nature's rich resources but also confronted with multiple challenges of a fragile ecosystem which requires collective action to create a fine balance between man and nature"

- Manoj Sinha, Lt Governor, Jammu and Kashmir, June 6, 2022¹

"My child will not spend his life tied to sheep and goats," Bilal Ali, a Bakarwal told me when I asked him why his group had chosen to migrate early. Nomadic communities like the Gujjar-Bakarwals are struggling to continue with their centuries-old migratory lifestyle. With Jammu and Kashmir witnessing extreme weather events like the earthquake in 2005, flash floods and landslides in 2010, and the massive floods of 2014; the Bakarwal population is finding it difficult to continue the centuries-old practice of transhumance pastoralism. In Jammu and Kashmir, the bi-annual migration of nearly 6 lakh transhuman tribal population is a regular event. The Bakarwals mostly rear the Australian Merino breed and local Poonchi and Kernai sheep, which cannot stand high summer temperatures in plain areas. They move to Kashmir from the plains and Pir-Panjal ranges of the Jammu region during the summers to reach the higher reaches of Kashmir and Ladakh. Gujjars and Bakarwals as well as the Gaddis in parts of Jammu form one of the largest transhumant communities in the Himalayas.² In fact, the tribal population of Jammu & Kashmir that migrates is larger than the total population of many countries such as the Maldives, Iceland, Malta, Suriname, Luxemburg, Brunei, Iceland, among others.³

Not all Migrations are the same

Gujjar-Bakarwals in Jammu and Kashmir follow four diverse migration patterns. Understanding the patterns of migration helps in developing a coherent understanding of the various challenges that the transhumant population faces during the migration.

Intra-district Migration: In this type of migration, people migrate from villages in plains or mountain bases to highland pastures or alpine meadows within the district.

^{*} Pallavi Sareen is a journalist based in Jammu and Kashmir. She was the founder editor of The Streight Line Policies and Practices, Issue No. 132, December 2022

Inter-district migration: It involves the movement of tribal from plains of Jammu division which includes the districts of Jammu, Samba, Kathua to highlands in Udhampur, Chenab region and adjoining mountain ranges.

Inter-province migration: This type of migration pattern is followed by the bulk of the Bakarwal population. It includes movement from most of the districts in Jammu province to Kashmir province during summers and reverse migration during winters.

Inter-State Migration: Less than one-tenth of this transhumant population migrates to Ladakh, Himachal Pradesh and Punjab. In many cases, families travel up to 600 km on foot, along with livestock and the journey can range from two to four or six weeks, including halts at various transit points.⁴

Tribal Researcher Javaid Rahi⁵, who focuses on the Gujjar-Bakarwal culture contributed to this research through his observations regarding the community. He explained how the transhumant population of Jammu and Kashmir is totally dependent upon climatic conditions for their sustenance. Their life is intertwined with weather. Even if they choose not to migrate due to one reason or the other, the survival of their livestock is dependent on it thus leaving them with no other choice but to embrace migration. "The breed of sheep, goats and cattle that these people own start indicating that it is time to move. Hot climatic conditions may result in death of the animals and even though the animals can withstand extreme winters, snowfall in the higher altitude, where they migrate to during the summer, creates a shortage of fodder and grazing land and hence the animals die of starvation," he explained.

Incidents of severe climatic disruptions were reported in 2019, before the onset of Covid-19 when the summer arrived early in Jammu forcing the Gujjar-Bakarwals to start their migration to higher pastures earlier than usual. They reached the highland pastures of Kashmir but were shocked to find that the snow had still not melted there yet. On May 28, *DownToEarth* had a conversation with Mukhtar Ahmed Chaudhary, Secretary, Jammu and Kashmir State Advisory Board for development of Gujjars and Bakarwals who adduced the delay in migration to "weather induced" reasons. He said, "Nomads have not been able to move at a pace and time best suited for them and their livestock."⁶ Khan Zaman, a 50-year-old Gujjar explained how they couldn't take their livestock to higher reaches since the sheep would die of starvation as the snow cover on the pastures left no space for grazing. He blamed the icy temperatures in Kashmir for the delay in melting of snow, when, at the same time, rising temperature in Jammu had forced them to leave early. Even in 2018, Kashmir witnessed an early but heavy snowfall in the beginning of November that had destructive effects on the tribal communities. Similarly, in the years 2020 and 2021, extreme winter conditions continued.

In the year 2022, as per *Ground Report*⁷, Kashmir witnessed an extreme heat wave following which there has been a change in the ground water levels. There was a visible decrease initially, causing a draught-like situation in both North and South Kashmir. This was followed by continuous rainfalls leading to flash floods. The unseasonal snowfalls also continued especially in the rural areas and higher reaches of Kashmir valley. The unseasonal snowfall left nomadic tribals in distress. The Gujjar and the Bakarwals panicked due to the extreme cold conditions and with the meadows covered in snow, there was loss of livestock as well. Since Gujjars and Bakarwals are nomads, they do not even own any permanent residence. They live in tents or temporary sheds during the course of their migration.

The nomads may not be aware of the jargons of climate change but there is a sort of climate consciousness because of their close relationship with nature. These pastoral transhumant communities have been noticing the recent changes in climatic conditions since they are directly impacted by it. In recent decades, urbanisation and climate disasters have put pressure on their livestock-based subsistence economy like never before. With increase in urbanisation, patches of forest land which served as temporary homes for the tribals and provided grazing land for their animals are now being diverted towards construction of government buildings and new projects. "Even Baba Ghulam Shah Badshah University which is among the reputed education institutions in Jammu and Kashmir (J&K) was built entirely on grazing land, even though alienating grazing land for any other purpose is prohibited by law," noted Javaid Rahi.

Since Gujjar-Bakkarwals were slow to claim private property, their traditional dwellings in the forests are also threatened by land-use change. These nomadic tribals make temporary sheds and homes near forest areas where their livestock and cattle can survive, finding fodder is easy and they can survive undisturbed by urbanisation. But often, they are labelled as encroachers on forest land and are forced to vacate by government officials. Khalid Choudhary, a Bakarwal explained how even the afforestation initiatives of J&K government are proving to be a hindrance for the nomads. He said, "They come for plantation drives and then do fencing of the area to keep our livestock out. They destroy natural forests by giving away the land for making buildings and roads and then come here for plantation drives." A retired forest official explained that the damage caused by reduced forest cover cannot be compensated through afforestation since it would take ages for the same kind of tree cover to be formed in an area. The nomadic tribes suffer since the grazing land is reduced. "Sheep and goat feed on leaves from plants and tall grass. Cattle like buffaloes and cows feed on grass. If you plant trees in an area and later seal that off to stop the nomads from entering, while using the forest land for development projects, it is counterproductive. These communities help in maintaining the ecological balance with their traditional knowledge," he said.

Extreme Weather Events Means Tragedies

The recently bifurcated union territory (UT) of J&K in the northernmost part of India, is one of the most severely affected regions in terms of both natural and man-made disasters. The region is prone to ecological hazards on account of its topography and varying extreme climate. The region has suffered massive floods, devastating earthquakes, and recurrent avalanches and landslides in recent times. Dr Shakil Ramshoo, Vice Chancellor of Islamic University of Science and Technology and an expert on glaciology having researched on climate change in the Himalayan region for a long time now, spoke about the changing weather patterns in Jammu and Kashmir. According to him, climate change is the driving factor behind such change.⁸ He mentioned that though it is impossible to always predict cloudbursts, landslides or other natural calamities, but the intensity and frequency of such events should be understood through the lens of global climate change. Extreme weather or climate events are phenomena that can have catastrophic effects on human communities, agricultural systems, and natural ecosystems. Extreme weather-related events, such as heat waves, freezing temperatures, torrential downpours, etc., are frequently transient. Extreme weather events may cause temporary damage in the form of loss of livestock, delayed migration or irreversible damage such as land collapse, loss of life, disconnecting higher reaches from pathways.

Snowfall/Snowstorms

Unpredictable or unseasonal snowfall covers the meadows leaving tribals with shortage of fodder for their livestock. Extreme cold conditions are detrimental to the survival of these nomads since they do not own permanent houses or shelters or sheds for their livestock to protect themselves and their animals. Snow avalanches are also frequent in J&K which is an added challenge.

Basharat Ali, a Bakarwal, recalled an instance from two decades ago. The nomads were moving from the Pir Panjal mountains to Kashmir as the temperature had started rising. An unseasonal snowstorm hit their caravan and hundreds of their sheep and horses died. He was just a 15-year-old boy then but still remembers how difficult it was to overcome that loss – "We had nothing except hand-made woollen blankets to survive the snowstorm. Imagine 50 families hiding under trees, trying to survive the wrath of nature," he said.

Heavy Rainfall/ Cloudburst

Indian researchers conducted a study in 2010 to assess climate change in.⁹ It pointed out that there will be a rise in minimum and maximum temperatures, as well as the number of rainy days in the Himalayan Region by 2030. The report assessed an annual increase by 5 to 13 percent by 2030 as compared to 1970. For some regions in J&K, it may rise up to 50 percent.

Nomads who own cattle prefer staying near rivulets or other water bodies but frequent rainfalls can lead to rise in water levels, flash floods and even submerging of the grasslands. Cloudbursts and lightning strikes are quite frequent in the upper reaches of the Himalayan region. These natural disasters are deadlier than man-made ones and end up damaging communities as a whole. Cloudbursts may lead to mud slides, land-slides further reducing grazing land. Soil degradation is another factor that cannot be overlooked in such circumstances.

Lightning Strikes

There have been numerous incidents reported in Jammu and Kashmir in recent years where hundreds of livestock including goats, sheep and cattle died due to lightning strike. 400 cattle recently died in Ganderbal due to lightning strike when some nomadic families were returning from the seasonal pastures.

Earthquakes

Certain regions in Jammu and Kashmir are prone to frequent earthquakes such as the Chenab Valley and the Pir Panjal areas. There are earthquakes in the distant peripheries of Marwah, Warwan, etc. There are regions where these nomadic communities reside temporarily during their migration. When an entire area collapses due to earthquake or develops cracks, it creates connectivity issues for them. Also, it is difficult for these communities to follow a single or a traditional route of grazing every time since in those upper reaches, there is always a possibility of the conventional pathways and tracks getting lost as a result of development of cracks or landslides, etc. This is another challenge faced by these communities that cover hundreds of miles on feet along serpentine tracks as halting and making camps for night stays becomes difficult in these treacherous terrains. Such loss of land further dents the possibility of their livestock getting adequate fodder in order to continue the onward journey. Loss of these regular and known paths not only creates connectivity issues but also leads to a host of other challenges which become difficult for the communities to mitigate. Sometimes a sheep that has grazed along paths which have been lost might get befuddled and jump into a gorge, and then the entire flock will follow. The owner might not realise till it's too late and thus will incur huge loses.

When it comes to cattle, migration is even harder because the animal is comparatively heavier. Cattle cannot cross streams easily and so they require proper paths. Furthermore, these communities believe that the new types of animal breeds that the government has been introducing cannot manage with the lifestyle of the pastoral community since they require more care and attention and cannot bear extreme climatic conditions as compared to the traditional breed of cattle.

Forest Fires

Forest fires, whether due to extreme heat, lightning strikes or man-made causes is another factor that deeply impacts these communities. Forest cover lost due to fire requires years to rebuild, and even then, some areas might never recover again. The stench of burnt trees and grass keeps livestock away from such areas and hence these are rendered unusable. The emergency response of forest officials is often delayed and by the time efforts are made to extinguish the fire, damage has already been done.

The Aftermath

Reduction of grazing land due to the aforementioned conditions leads to overgrazing in the areas that are still verdant and suitable thus leading to soil degradation. Amanat Ali, a 65 year old Bakarwal noted about the alarming rate at which forest cover is decreasing annually. The forest department, he said, instead of facilitating their movement in these areas, prohibits them from entering those – "If this continues, there will come a time when no land or fodder would be available at all. Every year, situation continues getting bleak," he said. He further pointed out that the problems faced by the animal-rearing community as well as the loss of life and livestock during snowstorms, earthquakes and flash floods is forcing families to give up migration.

Another possible consequence of changing climatic conditions is delay in migration. It may be due to snowfall or unseasonal snowfall. The delay leads to a cascading effect on lives of the pastoral transhumance communities. Their business is aligned with seasons and land use patterns. Any delay could mean reduced food availability for their livestock. Late migration means, much of the time would be lost in travel and the livestock would not get enough grass. Some sheep and goats may even die due to heat amid rising temperatures if the nomads are unable to reach colder regions in time. The understanding of the effects of climate change on human population necessitates a framework customised to the local realities. June 2022 witnessed the coldest day and the hottest day in the same year. March, which previously was known to be comparatively colder was really hot as well. Even *chillai kalaan* (the period known for harsh winters in Kashmir) went without any snowfall. These extreme weather events are simply indicators of climate change in Kashmir.

On June 22, *Ground Report*¹⁰ reported that at least 70 livestock which included sheep, goat and some cows were killed due to heavy rains and untimely snowfall in Kashmir. District sheep officer, Budgam, informed that 14 sheep were killed due to cloudburst at Dourien, 8 killed at Ladermad as a pine tree fell on them, few were killed due to hypothermia and a few others died due to non-availability of feed. They advised shepherds in high altitude points to return till weather improves. Tribals are dependent upon livestock for their livelihood and loss of the same, unless

certified as being caused by "calamity" is not eligible for compensation. The compensation mechanism is so complex, explained tribal activists that it must undergo different stages.

A committee is formed to evaluate every case. A veterinary doctor must certify that the animals died due to natural calamity and not due to illness or any other reason. District magistrate has to approve the compensation, and even then, the amount is not proportional to the loss. If each sheep is worth INR 10,000 and 50 sheep die due to lightning strike or something else, the families might be compensated INR 1000 per sheep. The total amount is hugely inadequate and since the individuals in the community are immersed in their day-to-day work, they have to decide whether to stay with the livestock that survived and take care of it or run from pillar-to-post for the compensation. The process, he said needs to be made easier, since no doctor or committee member would be willing to reach the actual location of the tragedy to witness how much damage has been done and whether or not the deaths were due to climatic conditions. "Sometimes the officials even doubt the photographs we show them, saying it must be from previous year, or they question the numbers. If we say 100 sheep died, they may only compensate for 50," said Barkat Choudhary.

Where does Climate Change Factor in when Making Policies?

There is a growing consensus among the next generation regarding giving up the practice of migration and settling down. Some blame it on the uneven weather patterns and others on the apathy of the government regarding implementation of policies that benefit the communities. The arduous process of migration and the complex range of factors influencing it require a holistic view of the administration in catering to the needs of tribals. The yardstick remains access to welfare schemes, without consulting the stakeholders while framing the same. Any policy model would not succeed without the wisdom of the tribal communities who have followed the practice of migration since centuries.

Though government has taken steps to increase access to essential services such as education, the same is found lacking in terms of facilitating migration, taking steps for ensuring sustainability and improving the process of compensation. Migratory schools and seasonal centers have helped the communities but livestock husbandry is a difficult task, especially in an ecologically fragile area such as Jammu and Kashmir. A detailed questionnaire sent to Secretary, Tribal Affairs, regarding the impact of climate change on nomads received no response. An overview of the website of Tribal Affairs, Department of Jammu and Kashmir shows emphasis on educating tribal children, preserving their language and culture but little mention is made regarding access to health facilities or compensation of loss due to natural calamities. Data, even if maintained, could not be found in the public domain.

A press release from Feb, 2022¹¹ does reveal that Union Ministry of Tribal Affairs approved major projects for Jammu and Kashmir such as the establishment of Centre for Research in Tribal Health (CRTH) and Centre for Research and Advance Planning for Tribals (CRAPT). It also mentioned that certain other projects such as healthcare screening of the transhumant population, integrated tribal village development planning, impact assessment programme for special central assistance to tribal sub schemes and other centrally sponsored schemes. Even though nomadic tribes are prominently animal-rearing communities, they allege that even the animal husbandry department pays little to no attention towards them. Special camps or workshops meant for Gujjar-Bakarwals are missing. The department's focus is mainly on commercial livestock farmers, dairy owners and the promotion of animal breeding.

Access to Public Healthcare Facilities

Even if one does not specify the condition of transhumant pastoralists in J&K, the human development index of transhumant communities across India is low. As per research¹², these communities face neglect due to their geographic isolation and logistic requirements. Even the health and poverty initiatives at national level fail to prioritise these communities. Healthcare for nomadic tribes in J&K is not just for people but also primarily for their livestock.

I spoke to some Bakarwals while they were migrating towards Kashmir regarding Covid-19 and noticed apathy towards allopathic medicines as well as vaccines. Government initiatives to reach even the farthest corner of J&K for its immunisation progress did benefit the community. However, that is not the case most of the time. Another study¹³ revealed that non-availability of medicines at low cost is one of the major factors responsible. Bakarwals also face mobility issues as these communities lack resources to travel long distances for treatment. It results in the population getting dependent upon home-remedies or natural herbs for treating illnesses. They use local herbs and shrubs to make concoctions for treating both animals and humans.

Even in cases of emergencies, the transhumant pastoralist tribes must walk long distances to reach the nearest healthcare facility resulting in poor outcomes. The household units of these tribes are referred to as *deras*. The *deras* spread in all directions to make makeshift residential on flat surfaces in slopes at higher reaches. Movement from those areas is generally difficult. Therefore, even if low-cost medicines are made available at public healthcare institutions, merely the cost of transportation to the facility would take up a significant amount. Often, the cost is even higher than that of medicinal and diagnostic cost. Since the subsistence economy of these nomadic tribes is dependent on animal rearing, such cost is met by selling the livestock. This results in the tribes losing their source of livelihood for the sake of facilitating treatment of the patient. There is also lack of awareness regarding health insurance which causes a heavy burden on the pocket of the family.

The problem of ensuring accessibility to the transhumant population is logistically complicated. Even the health facilities such as Primary Health Care centers or District Hospitals setup in lower reaches meant to cater to the population are not efficient or sufficient. The unavailability of doctors or drugs is one reason and sometimes the facilities are inoperative even during work hours. Sometimes, the families travel long distances only to find that the facility is shut. Trained doctors and nurses do not wish to be posted in such tough areas resulting in dearth of medical staff. Often the sub-district and district hospitals are also under-staffed. "In such strenuous circumstances, Indian Army is a life-saver," said Javaid Rahi. They are the ones who organise medical camps for these communities, provide free-of-cost medicine and even send veterinary doctors for frequent check-up of animals. But the camps are occasional and the help is not sufficient to meet the demand. The concept of healthcare that you see among Bakarwals is different than what you would find in other communities. A pregnant lady is found working till the final month of delivery and even after giving birth, takes barely a week off.

"The work-load is so much that one family cannot afford to have a member on bed rest. The mid-wife system is still continuing and we generally do not prefer hospital births, unless there is a complication," said Amanat Ali. His pregnant wife accompanied him during the migration on-foot even though she had the option of riding on a horse. "She found out she was pregnant after five months and feels like vomiting if she is asked to ride a horse. She will also walk. The only fear we have is that there should be no infection during the labor. There have been many deaths during childbirth because of it," he said. The Bakarwal women, because of their low social and political participation are unaware of schemes meant for their health and social upliftment. Government has launched a plethora of schemes such as Integrated Child Development Services, Janani Suraksha Yojana as well as Pradhan Mantri Matru Vandhana Yojna among others, since they live in far-flung areas and continue moving, they are unable to avail the benefits of such schemes. Their geographical isolation means lack of communication channels, so they hardly receive information about such programmes.

According to a survey conducted by Tribal Research and Cultural Foundation (TRCF), more than 71 percent of the nomads were unaware of state and central government schemes meant for upliftment of people falling in the Scheduled Tribe category. Previous reports have shown serious cases of malnutrition and anemia in adolescent tribal girls. Their body mass index and hemoglobin levels revealed that it is necessary to have health programmes directly targeting tribal girls. Awareness regarding immunisation programs for children is still lacking in the community resulting in hesitance. The same was experienced during the Covid-19 vaccination drive as well. Dr.Nusrat who was working with a PHC in Poonch at the time revealed that they travelled to a remote area in Surankote Tehsil for the vaccination drive but the women ran away when they saw her. "There were two women and they were so scared of the vaccine since they believed it may render them infertile or lead to their deaths. Such hesitance is common among tribals because of lack of awareness," she said.

There is also a general aversion to allopathic medicine as well among the older generation. A 75-year-old Bakarwal who was visibly coughing refused to agree that he actually needed medical help. Healthcare facilities for livestock is another challenge, mainly due to logistical issues. When sheep and goats wander in the forest area, they might consume poisonous plants or get infected with foot and mouth disease. However, for, the problem is carrying that animal to reach a health facility.

Tribal plan for the year 2022-23 was reviews in meeting conducted by Additional Chief Secretary, Health and Medical Education, Vivek Bharadwaj. The press release¹⁴ of that meeting revealed plans to provide healthcare facilities in *Dhoks*, tribal villages and transit accommodations on migratory routes. Plans for early procurement of Mobile Medical Units and Ambulances for tribal areas with dedicated service contract, dedicated Aarogya Mitras to facilitate patients from tribal population, Tribal ASHAs for extending healthcare services in *Dhoks*, deputation of doctors and paramedic staff were discussed. It was mentioned that Tribal Affairs Department had released INR 14.50 Cr under the 1st Tribal Health Plan for procurement of machinery and equipment for migratory population.

How many of these plans are actually manifested on ground is yet to be seen since on September 19 2021, Lt Governor Manoj Sinha had announced,¹⁵ "We have also finalised a plan to build transit accommodation for migratory population and develop tribal villages as Model villages." He talked about the tribal health plan, tribal bhavans and mobile medical care units in Jammu, Srinagar and Rajouri. "Rs 73 crores along with Central Government and the UT Capex budget, has been sanctioned this year for the Cluster Tribal Model Village," he said. He talked about the government's plans for sustainable livelihood of the transhumance pastoralists including 1500 mini sheep-farms, setting up milk villages and training of youth in marketing. However, there was no mention of climate change or the impact of natural calamities on the tribal population as well as the government's plan for the same. Till now, these plans have remained on paper and tribal activists allege that the Tribal Welfare Department has been functioning merely as nodal agency which received funds and further distributed them to other departments without putting any checks and balances in place to ensure that the funds are being used for the benefit of the tribal community.

Suggestions

State Advisory Board for Development of Gujjars and Bakarwals has previously recommended formulation of an insurance policy for livestock losses. However, no such initiative has been taken. The insurance would help meet up with the losses and act as a safeguard for continuing the tradition of migration. Workshops for nomadic tribals in languages that they speak is the need of the hour. There is Kissan-Vaani and other Doordarshan program for farmers and the Agriculture Department is focused upon reaching out to the farthest corner to teach farmers the latest techniques. Yet, workshops to increase their knowledge about diseases that their animals may catch, use of medicines as well as keeping up with weather updates are required. These programs could instill better understanding of healthcare schemes, the necessity of vaccines and important information regarding animal-rearing as well.

Since tribals are often the first-hand victims of natural calamities, the youth must be provided with some disaster-training and first-aid training. If someone drowns, gets hypothermia or gets bitten by a snake, which is pretty common, how to respond? This knowledge could be crucial to save someone's life when no expert is around. Since tribals live in isolated areas, often cut off from the urban world, disaster-training and first-aid training is must.

The *deras* must be provided with toolkits that include some emergency medicines for the tribals as well as animals. Some helpline numbers should be shared with them and there should be programs for awareness regarding consultation. While formulating policies for tribes, the stakeholders which include tribal researchers, tribal activists and the families should also be talked to. While the government is also of the view that animal-rearing communities contribute immensely to society, the departments responsible including the Animal Husbandry department and the Tribal Affairs department must play a proactive role in ensuring that the transhumance pastoralists of Jammu and Kashmir are facilitated. Whether it is about access to basic facilities such as healthcare or strengthening the subsistence economy by providing safeguards against natural and man-made disasters, the tribes that fall low in human development index should receive adequate support and guidance.

Health programmes targeting adolescent girls in particular must be launched and they must be offered health services at their doorstep. Such kind of planning would require a coordinated approach and communication between the department and the tribal community. Since the Gujjar-Bakarwal community still perceives health with an outdated lens, a focused approach for changing their outlook on health is needed so that preventive measures can be taken. The younger population is more prone to major illnesses and as such, awareness and quick action can be key to saving lives. It has been widely reported in many cases when some Gujjar or Bakarwal pregnant women delivered a child on-route to the hospital but did not survive. Efforts must be made to stop such instances by creating a better system in place.

Notes

¹ Excelsior Correspondent, "We are facing worst impact of climate change: LG", *Daily Excelsior*, June 6, 2022. ² Faridi, A. "Unravelling the 'PPP' Model Affecting Nomadic Pastoralists in Jammu & Kashmir," *The Bastion*, August 9, 2021. https://thebastion.co.in/politics-and/environment/resource-management/unravelling-the-ppp-model-affecting-nomadic-pastoralists-in-jammu-kashmir

³ Choudhary, S. I. "Missing Villages': J&K's 'Transhumant' People Are Almost a Nation on the Move," *The Quint,* April 7, 2022. https://www.thequint.com/voices/opinion/missing-villages-jks-transhumant-people-are-almost-a-nation-on-the-move

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Javaid Rahi is an Indian author, a tribal social reformer, and a researcher of national repute who has done pioneering work focusing on tribal Gujjar-Bakarwal culture.

⁶ Nissa, Z. "Is climate change affecting the migrations of Kashmir's pastoralists?" *Down To Earth.* May 28, 2019. https://www.downtoearth.org.in/news/climate-change/is-climate-change-affecting-the-migrations-of-kashmir-s-pastoralists--64789

⁷ Wani, B. "Climate Change: Impact of Untimely Snowfall on Nomads of Kashmir," *Ground Report.* July 20, 2022. https://groundreport.in/climate-change-impact-of-untimely-snowfall-on-nomads-of-kashmir/

⁸ Kathju, J. "Serious ecological crisis': Experts sound alarm on climate change in Kashmir," *The Kashmir Walla*. Jan 8,2022. https://thekashmirwalla.com/serious-ecological-crisis-experts-sound-alarm-on-climate-change-in-kashmir/

⁹Ministry of Environment & Forests Assessment, I. I. (2010). Climate Change and India: A sectoral and regional analysis for 2030s, 2010.

¹⁰ Jain, P. "Why are sheep dying in Kashmir?" *Ground Report*. June 22, 2022. https://groundreport.in/climate-change-is-killing-livestock-in-kashmir/

¹¹ PTI, "Union ministry of tribal affairs approves major projects for J-K", *The Print*, February 8, 2022. ¹² Veenapani Rajeev Verma, S. G. "Traversing the margins: Access to healthcare by Bakarwals in remote and conflict-prone Himalayan regions of Jammu," *Pastoralism Journal*. 2019

¹³ Mishra, S. Y. Migration and Health-Care Access: Barriers to Access Government Health Services by Migrant Tribal Community Living in an Eastern Indian city. *International Journal of Medical Science and Public Health*. 2015:101-108.

¹⁴ "Bharadwaj reviews proposals under Tribal Health Plan", *Daily Excelsior*, February 4, 2022.

¹⁵ "Govt committed to protect interests of J&K's tribal population: LG Sinha", *Greater Kashmir*, September, 19, 2021

- 113. The Invisible Migrant Workers: In Life, In Death
- 114. Biometric, Notion of Governmentally and Gender Relations in Rohingya Refugee Camps
- 115. Media on Migrants : Reports from Field -I
- 116. Media on Migrants : Reports from Field -II
- 117. Transition without Justice in the Postcolonial World: Protection Discourses for Refugees & Migrants in South Asia
- 118. Media Discourses on the Bengal Bangladesh Border
- 119. Culture, Migration and the Time of an Epidemic: The Nautanki Theatres/ Bhojpuri Nataks in 1990s 120.COVID-19, Migrants, Media
- 121. Refugees and Migrants as Subjects of Economy and Politics
- 122. COVID-19 and After: Work, Life and Salience of Primitive Accumulation
- 123. Two Essays on Ethics and Practices of Care and Solidarity
- 124. Protection and Punishment : Myths and Realities of Refugee Protection
- 125. Migrants, Refugees, and the Contested Question of Social Protection
- 126. Two Essays on the Rohingya Crisis
- 127. Development and Displacement in the Damodar Valley of India
- 128. Election Campaigns as Performance: Migrants and Refugees as an Issue in West Bengal Elections
- 129 Brecht, Manto and Two Situations
- 130 The Kaibarta Question in Barak Vally, Assam: A Curious Case of Settlements in Flux
- 131 Navigating Precarity: Analysing Multiple Narratives of Citizenship in Assam

- 74. Cities, Rural Migrants & the Urban Poor-III: Migration & the Urban Question in Delhi
- 75. Classes, People, and Populism
- 76. Logistical Space I: Logistics and Social Governance
- 77. Logistical Space II: Mobilities and Spaces
- 78. Logistical Space III: Hubs, Connectivity and Transit
- 79. Logistical Space IV: The Asam Paradigm
- 80. People, Politics and Protests I: Calcutta & West Bengal, 1950s 1960s
- 81. People, Politics and Protests II: Bengal and Bihar
- 82. People, Politics and Protests III: Marxian, Literary Debates and Discourses
- 83. The Importance of being Siliguri, or the Lack therof: Border-Effect and the "Untimely" City in North Bengal
- 84. Logistical Space V: Representations of Connectivity
- 85. Logistical Space VI: Logistics and the Reshaping of Global Governance
- 86. Logistical Space VII: Finance Capital & Infrastructure Development
- 87. Logistical Space VIII: Trade, Capital & Conflict
- 88. Logistical Space IX: Conflict & Social Governance in Northeast India
- 89. People, Politics and Protests IV: Occupy College Street: Notes from the Sixties
- 90. People, Politics and Protests V: The Creative & Cultural Dimension of the Naxalbari Movement
- 91. People, Politics and Protests VI: Karporri Thakur
- 92. People, Politics and Protests VII: The Radical Rural
- 93. People, Politics and Protests VIII: Left Front Government in West Bengal (1971-1982)
- 94. Population and Rent in Capital
- 95. Capital: Value & Translation
- 96. The Urban Turn
- 97. Peasants, Students, Insurgents and Popular Movements in Contemporary Assam
- 98. Migration and Governance I: Promises and Paradoxes of a Global Gaze
- 99. Migration and Governance II: Responsibility to Protect- Questions of Race, Religion, Resource and the Unspoken Fourth
- 100. Migration and Governance III: Population Flows, Refugees, and the Responsibility to Protect in the Global Protection System
- 101. Migration and Governance IV: Global Capitalism and Refugee and Migrant Labour
- 102. Migration and Governance V: Statelessness, International Conventions and the Need for New Initiatives ? Addressing the New Frontiers of Statelessness
- 103. Migration and Governance VI : Migrants and Movements across Asia : Mobility, Global Migration Governance and the European Response
- 104. Global Capitalism, Informal Economy and the Question of Labour
- 105. Reflections on the Mediterranean Refugee Crisis
- 106. Populism- I :Politics, Policies and Social justice
- 107. Populism- II: States and Political Parties
- 108. Populism- III: Leadership and Governmentality
- 109. Interrogating Citizenship: Perspectives from India's East and North East
- 110. Auto-Ethnoraphy as a Research Method: Evidence from Field Research on Ethiopian Irregular Migrants in South Africa
- 111 Borderlands, Migration and Labour
- 112 Two Writings on Climate, Disasters and Displacement

- 31 Local Dynamics, Universal Context : Border Trading through Moreh, Manipur
- 32 Two Studies on Asylum Seekers and Other Immigrants in Finland
- 33 Endangered Lives on The Border: Women in the Northeast
- 34 Globalisation and Labouring Lives
- 35 Right to Information in a Globalising World
- 36 Bengal-Bangladesh Border and Women
- 37 Between Ecology and Economy : Environmental Governance in India
- 38 Incomplete Citizenship, Statelessness and Human Trafficking: A Preliminary Analysis of The Current Situation in West Bengal, India
- 39 Place of Poor in Urban Space
- 40 Law and Democratic Governance: Two Studies from Europe
- 41 Finding a Point of Return: Internally Displaced Persons in Sri Lanka
- 42 Colonialism, Resource Crisis and Forced Migration
- 43 Situating Transit Labour
- 44 Two Essays on Security Apparatus
- 45 Governing Flood, Migration and Conflict in North Bihar
- 46 A Gigantic Panopticon: Counter-Insurgency and Modes of Disciplining and Punishment in Northeast India
- 47 Public Interest Litigation in India: Implications for Law and Development
- 48 Governing Caste and Managing Conflicts-Bihar, 1990-2011
- 49 Emerging Spaces and Labour Relations in Neo-Liberal India
- 50 Peace by Governance or Governing Peace? A Case Study of the United Liberation Front of Assam (ULFA)
- 51 Women, Conflict and Governance in Nagaland
- 52 Tripura: Ethnic Conflict, Militancy & Counterinsurgency
- 53 Government of Peace
- 54 Bengal Borders and Travelling Lives
- 55 Financialisation, Labour Market Flexibility, and Global Crisis
- 56 The Chronicle of a Forgotten Movement: 1959 Food Movement Revisited
- 57 The Religious Nature of Our Political Rites
- 58. Social Impact of the City Planning Machinery: Case Study of Road-Widening in Bangalore
- 59. In Search of Space: The Scheduled Caste Movement in West Bengal after Partition
- 60. Stateless in Law: Two Assessments
- 61.Failed by Design? : The Limitations of Statebuilding
- 62. Contesting Ideas on Peace (A Report & Some Reflections)
- 63. Body/Law/Technology: The Political Implications of Society as Apparatus
- 64. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-I: An Overview
- 65. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-II: War, Debt, and Reconstruction of Economy
- 66. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-III: The Arab Question in Post-Colonial France
- 67. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-IV: Mobile Labour and the New Urban
- 68. West Bengal-Bangladesh Borders: Humanitarian Issues
- 69. Policing a Riot-torn City: Kolkata, 16-18 August 1946
- 70. Labour, Law and Forced Migration
- 71. Rohingyas in India: Birth of a Stateless Community
- 72. Cities, Rural Migrants & the Urban Poor-I: Migration & the Urban Question in Kolkata
- 73. Cities, Rural Migrants & the Urban Poor-II: Migration & the Urban Question in Mumbai

- 1 People on the Move: How Governments Manage Moving Populations
- 2 Resources for Autonomy Financing the Local Bodies
- 3 Peace Accords as the Basis of Autonomy
- 4 Debates Over Women's Autonomy
- 5 Unequal Communication: Health and Disasters As Issues of Public Sphere
- 6 Globalisation, State Policies And Sustainability of Rights
- 7 Autonomies in the North and the North East: More Freedom or the Politics of Frontier Management?
- 8 Examining Autonomy : The 73rd Constitutional Amendment in Assam
- 9 Democracy, Autonomy and the Community Media
- 10 Women and Forced Migration
- 11 Flags and Rights
- 12 A Status Report on Displacement in Assam and Manipur
- 13 Weapons of the Weak: Field Studies on Claims to Social Justice in Bihar & Orissa
- 14 Towards a New Consideration: Justice for the Minorities
- 15 Conflict, War & Displacement
- 16 The Draft National Rehabilitation Policy: A Critique
- 17 Limits of the Humanitarian: Studies in Situations of Forced Migration
- 18 Prescribed, Tolerated, and Forbidden Forms of Claim Making
- 19 Three Studies on Law and The Shifting Spaces of Justice.
- 20 Primitive Accumulation and Some Aspects of Work and Life in India in The Early Part of The Twenty First Century.
- 21 Citizens, Non-Citizens, and The Stories of Camps
- 22 Tales of Two Cities
- 23 Ways of Power, Minorities, and Knowledge on Minorities: An Assessment of Research Policies and Practices.
- 24 Whither Right to Food? Rights Institutions and Hungry Labour in Tea Plantations of North Bengal
- 25 Hunger, Food Scarcity, & Popular Protests in West Bengal
- 26 Cyclone Aila & the Sundarbans: An Enquiry into the Disaster and Politics of Aid and Relief
- 27 View from India: Media & Minorities in Europe
- 28 Protecting the Rights of the Tsunami Victims: The Sri Lanka Experience
- 29 Nation Building and Minority Alienation in India
- 30 Environment and Migration Purulia, West Bengal

POLICIES AND PRACTICES is the research paper series brought out by the Mahanirban Calcutta Research Group (CRG). Writings under this series can be referred to and used for public educational purposes with due acknowledgment.

ISSN 2348-0297