

Policies and Practices 88
December 2017

Published by: Mahanirban Calcutta Research Group GC-45, Sector-III, First Floor Salt Lake City Kolkata-700106 India Web: http://www.mcrg.ac.in

ISSN 2348 0297

Printed by: Graphic Image New Market, New Complex, West Block 2nd Floor, Room No. 115, Kolkata-87

Gefördert durch die Rosa-Luxemburg-Stiftung e.V. aus Mitteln des Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung der Bundesrepublik Deutschland. Sponsored by the Rosa Luxemburg Foundation eV with funds of the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development of the Federal Republic of Germany.

The Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung (RLS) is a Germany based foundation working in South Asia and other parts of the world on the subjects of critical social analysis and civic education. It promotes a sovereign, socialist, secular, and democratic social order, and aims at present members of society and decision-makers with alternative approaches to such an order. Research organizations, groups working for self-emancipation, and social activists are supported in their initiatives to develop models that have the potential to deliver social and economic justice. The work of Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung, South Asia can be accessed at www.rosalux.in.

# Logistical Spaces IX

# Conflict & Social Governance in Northeast India

Paula Banerjee & Sucharita Sengupta

# Conflict & Social Governance in Northeast India

# Paula Banerjee and Sucharita Sengupta \*

#### Introduction

Social governance is a form of governance that evolved in relation to conflict management and peace in the last few decades. With its origin partly in western style mass democracy, social welfare and market economy, and partly in the evolution of a sense of justice that emanated from struggles against colonialism, social governance has grown into a system that has many trajectories. Post-colonial states have often addressed demands for justice through the axis of development, and in a neoliberal world, that has meant the growth of market economy, capital accumulation and changes in infrastructure in tandem with neo-liberal politics and crony capitalism. This has created an occasion for massive transfer of resources necessitating new logistical apparatus. The logistical spaces that are used as conduits are the favoured spaces. This caused massive increase in governmental expenditure and the beneficiaries were a favoured few. In this circuitous mode of development of capitalism, induction of new groups became increasingly a necessity when older groups were no longer willing to participate, creating new fissures in society. This has resulted in new kinds of governing patterns that has stemmed the radicalism of sub-nationalist demands through development oriented conflict management, making logistics intrinsic to conflict resolution. Therefore, logistical imperatives were created that favoured allies to the detriment of those that chose to defy, thereby bringing conflict within the communities that for years opposed the state. In this mode of governance, conflict was managed by changing state versus community conflicts into conflicts within communities. One can see this phenomena emerging in large sections of Northeast India.

In the Northeast, the older regime of rights in the conflict zones consisted of sets of claims based on largely ethnicity, homeland, certain forms of property and certain set of gender relations. The introduction of the new modes of governance has, for the first time in the history of the region, inaugurated a new era of struggles for rights, or more correctly speaking, struggles for a new set of rights such as rights over resources, rights within families etc. India's Northeast has turned into an important zone in view of New Delhi's 'Look East' policy. With 98% of its borders with China, Myanmar, Bhutan, Bangladesh and Nepal, India's Northeast is home to many ethnic groups, which are engaged in movements for autonomy, self determination and self preservation; in many cases, their struggles were against the state. Sometimes, these struggles have turned violent, leading to proliferation of armed insurgent groups, like the ULFA, NLFT, NDFB, NSCN (I-M), NSCN (K) and many such outfits. Today, the Northeast is mostly studied as a theatre of insurgency and counter-insurgency. The Northeast presents a myriad picture of integration without consent, massive migration leading to

Policies and Practices, Issue No. 88, December 2017

<sup>\*</sup> Researchers for MCRG-RLS Project on Social and Political Mapping of Popular Movements, Logistical Vision and Infrastructure.

demographic shifts, cultural nationalism, irredentism, increasing corruption and criminalization, and violence - both community sponsored and state sponsored - making Northeast the theatre of multiple conflicts. It is important to see how the Indian state has tried to govern the Northeast through different modes of social governance. In this paper, we will study the trajectories of social governance undertaken by the state particularly in the context of Nagaland, historically seen as the most conflict prone state in Northeast India. But before getting into any specific history of Nagaland, let us look into the general history of conflict in Northeast India, embedded in which is the specific history of conflict in Nagaland.

#### Northeast: A Cauldron of Conflict

The British began administering the region that has come to be known as Northeast India through a series of acts such as the Schedules District Act of 1874 and the Frontier Tracts Regulations of 1880. In 1873, the British passed the Inner Line Regulation. According to one analyst, the logic behind this regulation was that the "unrestricted movements which existed between the British subjects in Assam and the wild tribes living across the frontiers frequently led to quarrels and sometimes to serious disturbances." The British administration also wanted to control the rubber trade that was still in the hands of the hill people and that caused frequent skirmishes between the groups. The Inner Line Regulation was a means to separate the civilized plains people and the wild hill people. The inner line did not in any way give sovereignty to the hill people; rather it was a means by which administrative zones of the hills and the plains were separated ostensibly because the civilized faced problems with cohabiting with the wild. The Government of India Bill of 1935 classified the hill areas of Assam into excluded and partially excluded areas. This was done mainly to exclude the hill areas of Assam from the jurisdiction of the Reformed Provincial Government that included the plane lands of Brahmaputra and Barak Valleys. This policy resulted in the separate political evolution of the hills and the plane lands. The excluded areas were not demarcated to protect regional autonomy. Rather, it was meant to keep recalcitrant groups at bay. It also meant that the hills remained excluded from all constitutional experiments that were embarked upon within the jurisdiction of British India. To justify such demarcations, there was a process of distortion and alienation of certain groups of people, at least in the official discourses, particularly groups that were considered recalcitrant. Logistical deprivation of the hill people of Northeast India therefore began even before the Northeast emerged as a region.

During the Constituent Assembly Debates, the process continued. It was at the time of the debate on the provisions of the Sixth Schedule that such a mentality of the officials from the plane lands became apparent, particularly among members of the dominant religious, caste and class groups. When there were discussions of making the Naga Hills an autonomous council, some of the responses of the members of the Assembly reflected the attitude of the architects of the Constitution towards these people. Kuladhar Chaliha from Assam was particularly vocal. He said:

The Nagas are a very primitive and simple people and they have not forgotten their old ways of doing summary justice when they have a grievance against anyone. If you allow them to rule us or run the administration it will be a negation of justice or administration and it will be something like anarchy.<sup>1</sup>

Though not as loud as Kuladhar Chaliha, there were many others who made it obvious that the Nagas did not belong among those who could govern. Brajeshwar Prasad from Bihar during the same debate stated that "responsibilities of parliamentary life can be shouldered by those who are

competent, wise, just and literate. To vest wide political powers into the hands of the tribals, is the surest method of inviting chaos, anarchy and disorder throughout the length and breadth of this country." Even Gopinath Bordoloi who drafted the Sixth Schedule commented that currently hardly any of the tribes can be called self-governing but "the time may come when they may become fit to govern themselves."

Discussions on the Sixth Schedule were a precursor of things to come in the future. The members of the Constituent Assembly who were deliberating on the creation of a democratic constitution for India were not merely obsessed with the idea of maintaining order as Paul Brass has suggested. That was just one of the things that they concerned themselves with. They were also in the business of constructing a citizenship that would be loyal to the order that they were seeking to maintain. On the basis of such criteria, they constructed notions and discourses of who belonged and who did not. They created a hierarchy of citizenship in which many Northeastern tribal groups occupied the bottom rung. Their avowed difference was considered deviance and they were at best patronised and at worst vilified. At the back of everyone's mind was the fact that these people were not us and so, unworthy of any autonomy or self-rule. Even as early as in the Constituent Assembly, the nation's leaders were using the language of their colonisers to deal with all those they considered as other/deviant. This was decisive in shaping state attitudes towards the region. An analysis of later laws such as the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act, The National Security Act etc. will portray how groups were marked recalcitrant by evolving border laws and were then treated as criminals.

Most of Northeast India falls within border zones and as such it is considered as highsecurity area. As already stated before, in large parts of the eight states that compose India's Northeast, there are a number of irredentist movements. Also, much of Northeast India is under the gruesome Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act (AFSPA). The AFSPA was a takeoff, with certain modifications, from the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Ordinance 1942 of British India. Only it is much harsher than the previous Ordinance. In the previous Ordinance, an officer of the rank of Captain was authorised with power to take action, but in this Act, power rested even with non-commissioned officers. Also the previous Ordinance was meant for the whole of India unlike the present one. The 1958 Act was meant for only the Naga Hills and parts of Manipur. But like the Ordinance, the AFSPA is meant to suppress civil society dissent and legitimise state violence. As one observer has maintained, "logic demanded that an India that fought against such powers would, when independent, get rid of such legislation. Events, however, have proved the contrary." As stated above, the Act came into operation in 1958 ostensibly for a period of six months, but till date it has not been removed, even after multiple protests by civil liberties organisations all over India. The AFSPA of 1958 gave the state government the power to define any area as disturbed. The Home Minister argued, when faced with the criticism that he was wresting power away from the state governments, that he was actually increasing the powers of the states, as this Act empowered them to summon the military whenever they wanted to do so. That this was hardly the case would become apparent in 1972 when this provision was changed. For now the state government had the power to declare any area as disturbed. The AFSPA is a prime example of how democracy legitimises violence on the people that it considers errant/deviant. The evolving history of this Act portrays how a state by institutionalising violence, securitises a certain area leading to the securitisation of the whole region. Among its many articles, there is one that says that anyone can be shot dead even on suspicion of being a terrorist by a commissioned member of the armed forces.

The initial peace negotiations with the Nagas were not successful. The first Peace Accord that the GOI signed with the Naga rebels in 1960 gave statehood to Nagaland, but for the Nagas it was too little too late. Then in 1975, the Shillong Accord was signed. That did not last for long.

There were groups which condemned the agreement from its inception and that ultimately created factionalism among the rebels. The Mizo Accord of 1986 was the first successful peace accord signed by the GOI with a rebel Mizo National Front group in Northeast India. Meanwhile the Assam conflict worsened with the ascendance of the United Liberation Front of Assam (ULFA). A major breakthrough came in Northeast India when the GOI signed a ceasefire with the National Socialist Council of Nagaland (NSCN) led by Isak Chishi Swu and Thuingaleng Muivah (of the IM faction) in 1997.

## Look East/Act East

It was around the 1990s that Indian foreign policy towards the neighbouring east changed. This change came in tandem with the change in thinking about the Northeast. According to one social scientist, traditionally the majoritarian understanding was that:

Northeast for long has suffered what may be termed as an acute policy void—which may be explained in a large measure by its emergence as a completely landlocked region eternally condemned to peripheral status, accordingly 'lost' forever to the policy makers and the attendant realisation that there is very little that could have been done to save the region and bring it at par with the rest of India and in part by New Delhi's persistent dismissal of many of the present conflicts afflicting the region as simple law and order problems calling for equally simple law and order solutions.<sup>5</sup>

It was in the late 1990s again that realisation dawned that the Naga problem was uniquely political in nature and it needed a political solution. Look East and Act East worked very well indeed because this brought a new logistical thinking that bolstered the politics that the state began promoting. Northeast, that was tied to the mainland through the 21 km long Siliguri corridor that is popularly known as the 'chicken's neck' began to be discursively perceived not as a landlocked peripheral region of endemic poverty as in yester years but as that part of South Asia that seamlessly extended into Southeast Asia and that could bring in seemingly endless possibilities of development. New logistical imagination was at play here. As one policy maker explained:

It was meant, at a fundamental level, to reconnect and reach out in the civilizational space we share with our near neighbors in Southeast Asia, and catalyze the sharing of capacities and opportunities to improve the economic well-being of our peoples. Our relationship with Asean was the natural pivot in this deepening collaboration. It is a fact little recognized that India is as much a Southeast Asian nation as a South Asian nation, given the rich linguistic and ethnic mosaic of our Northeast, and the fact that we share borders with a large Asean nation – Myanmar. Our Andaman and Nicobar Islands chain are also in the very close vicinity of Southeast Asia.<sup>6</sup>

So the imagination of India as merely a South Asian nation was transformed and the Northeast was meant to have a serious role in this transformation. As for the people in Northeast, it contributed to their nostalgia about reconnecting with their kith and kin along the border. Also, there was hope that the Northeastern economy will be liberated as a result of looking and acting towards the east. It could even allow the unemployed youth of Northeast to seek employment in Southeast Asia. Since 2002, India became a Summit-level Dialogue Partner of ASEAN. India also acceded to the Treaty of Amity and Cooperation in Southeast Asia in 2003. Then, India accepted the Comprehensive Economic Cooperation Framework Agreement, also in 2003, convincing others that finally, India was serious about its cooperation with the Southeast Asian nations. The buzzword that

accompanied this policy shift was connectivity. This again meant a major logistical advantage for the Northeast. The India-Myanmar-Thailand Trilateral Highway from Moreh to Mae Sot was meant to connect the region by land. Air and rail links were also meant to be developed in tandem.

In 2014 came the Fifth Northeast Connectivity Summit. Organised by FICCI, the summit was attended by representatives of GOI, state governments, industry, diplomats, and members of World Bank and United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP). They addressed issues pertaining to the current economic situation of Northeast India. They also discussed the development of an industrial corridor, roads, railways, airports, waterways and the power sector. The second meet was meant to take stock of the gains of these connectivity projects. It was felt that the full measure of success was not achieved. The reason forwarded was that implementing agencies were not in sync with the plans. It was decided that a Northeast Regional Project Implementing Authority would be set up. This agency was expected to not just handle the finances but also provide hands on monitoring. After all with a land area of 8 percent and population of a little over 3 percent, the Northeast states received 10 percent of the budget of each ministry apart from the states' planned allocations.<sup>7</sup>

In terms of economy we can perhaps explore the situation in Northeast India and see how Nagaland is faring among the North-Eastern Region (NER). A researcher made a comparative analysis of structural changes in the economy of the NER and found a significant change in contribution of different sectors, when comparing the time period of 1993-94 to that of 2009-10. The primary sector declined by -13.75 percent, the secondary sector improved marginally by +1.45 percent and the tertiary sector improved dramatically by +12.39 percent. Yet the case of Nagaland was different. In Nagaland, there was a substantial decline in the tertiary sector, but the primary and secondary sectors improved. Within the primary sector, contribution from agriculture decreased rapidly whereas contribution from mining increased. But in the case of Nagaland, there has been a marked increase in the share of contribution of agriculture to NSDP from 20.80 to 27.4 percent. However, Nagaland's contribution to mining did not increase. In the secondary sector, the increase has been due to growing construction activities but manufacturing activities did not grow. In this sector, Nagaland followed the North-eastern trend. Unlike much of Northeast, in Nagaland, there was a noticeable decline in the tertiary sector including transport and communication, trade, hotel and restaurant, public administration etc.<sup>8</sup>

In terms of resource sharing, Nagaland does not fare too well when compared to the other Northeastern states. In terms of long-term forecast of electrical energy requirements for Nagaland, it is presumed that in 2021 it will only be 271 MW and that is a miniscule part of the 5075 MW that is expected to be the total requirement for NER. Only Sikkim and Arunachal Pradesh have lesser requirement than Nagaland. Therefore, major industrialisation of Nagaland is not in the cards yet. In terms of road density, Nagaland has one of the highest 1345.32 / 1000 km. It is exceeded by only Assam and Tripura. Nagaland has only one airport in Dimapur and very little rail connectivity. Nagaland with its high literacy rates has 57 colleges with an average enrolment of 486 students per college. The number is way higher than Mizoram, Sikkim, Arunachal Pradesh and Tripura. Of the 11 medical schools of NER, Nagaland has none; only 2 Industrial Training Institutes of the 63 that are there in the region, are in Nagaland. Yet in terms of tourism, Nagaland features prominently, and among the tourism circuits proposed, there are the Dimapur-Kohima-Wokha-Mokokchung-Mon-Sibsagar circuit and the Dimapur-Kohima-Senapati-Imphal-Moreh circuit. This shows that Look/Act East is yet to prove its beneficial effects on the economy of Nagaland.

This mixed result in economy for Nagaland is reflected once again when one compares per capita income of Nagaland to that of other North-eastern states.

Table 1: Per Capita Income of North Eastern States

No.	States	1993-94	1999-00	2004-05	2009-10
1.	Nagaland	9129	14107	20234	22418
2.	Arunachal Pradesh	8733	13990	27271	51644
3.	Assam	5715	12282	16782	27197
4.	Manipur	5846	13260	18527	28531
5.	Meghalaya	6893	14355	23793	42601
6.	Mizoram	8319	16443	24662	45982
7.	Sikkim	8402	14890	26693	48937
8.	Tripura	5534	14119	24394	35799

Source: CSO, State Domestic Product (State Series), Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation CSO, GOI.

It is sometimes assumed that instead of per capita income, which in the case of Nagaland is lowest among Northeastern states in 2009-10, per capita consumption expenditure is a more preferable indicator of an individual's command over resources. It might even be a better measure of economic well-being as it allows smoothening of income fluctuations. Given below is the data for the monthly per capita consumption expenditure for the Northeastern states. Although the data is slightly dated, it substantiates the argument that any attempt to understand something as complex as social governance in Nagaland through one set of indicators is impossible because of the variations presented within the indicators themselves. The two indicators ideally should have been complementary, but in the case of Nagaland, it is widely divergent as is reflected in Tables 1 and 2 respectively.

Table 2: Monthly per Capita Consumption Expenditure of NE States

No.	States	1993-94	1999-00	2004-05
1.	Nagaland	454.48	1005.99	1094.88
2.	Arunachal Pradesh	343.75	672.31	798.76
3.	Assam	280.42	473.42	613.67
4.	Manipur	305.59	596.36	643.62
5.	Meghalaya	390.00	639.13	762.26
6.	Mizoram	472.59	935.53	993.72
7.	Sikkim	321.12	559.97	738.52
8.	Tripura	367.43	589.50	578.91

Source: Human Development Report of NE States. 11

In terms of monthly per capita consumption expenditure, Nagaland stands above the others. In terms of logistical networks created by the state, Nagaland has been much deprived. Therefore, those who could access resources provided by the state were state beneficiaries because of their proximity to state power.

## Demographic Profile of Nagaland

By now, Nagaland's ascension to statehood from the Naga Hills district of Assam and NEFA provinces in 1963 has become a familiar story. This late start in statehood meant that Nagaland lost out on the benefits that could have been accrued from the first three Five Year Plans. The traditional lives of the Nagas revolved around the village. Irredentism has been a challenge which the Nagas had to live with for a long time. The Nagas always had a special relationship with their land and villages. The Village Council, the Village Development Board and the Communitisation of Public Institution and Services Act, 2002 were the major institutions that shaped Naga lives. Article 371 (A) of the Indian Constitution remains a cornerstone to policy making in the state. This has, on the one hand, ensured the protection of Naga traditions and Naga way of life, but it may alternately have adversely affected the economy as it was a deterrent to inflow of investment for a long time. Nagaland as a state has been overwhelmingly formed by scheduled tribes. Article 371 (A) has enabled the state to retain its tribal character albeit after some fluctuations. The scheduled tribes form 86.5 percent of the total population and 92.8 percent of the rural population as the 2011 Census states. Table 3 reflects the effects of demographic peculiarities of Nagaland.

Table 3: Distribution of Population

	RURAL POPULATION		URBAN POPULATION			TOTAL POPULATION			
	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
2011	725472	682064	1407536	99177	271789	570966	1024649	953853	1978502
2001	846651	789164	1635815	195035	157786	352821	1041686	946950	1988636
1991	522235	479088	1001323	119047	89176	208223	641282	568264	1209546

Sources: Census 2001, 2011

An interesting feature about the population growth rate in Nagaland is that from the year 1981 to 2001, it recorded the highest growth rate in the country. With a decadal growth rate of 56.08 percent between 1991-2001 and 64.53 percent between 2001-2011, it had the unique distinction of being one of the highest in the world. Yet amazingly between 2001 and 2011, the population showed a negative growth rate. The absolute decrease in population was 11534 and it was the lowest in India. Unlike the rural population, there was the steady increase in urban population even between 2001 and 2011. As far as the percentage of ST population is concerned, it was 93.1 percent in 1961. By 1981, it came to an all time low of 84 percent before it kept increasing steadily. As for sex ratio, in 1981 it was 863, in 1991 it climbed to 886 and in 2001 it rose to 909.12 In 2011, the sex ratio climbed to 931 and came close to the country's average.

It is interesting to note the changes in rural and urban population. In 1971, 90 percent of the population lived in rural areas, and by 2011, that number declined to 71 percent. Towns were a late arrival for Nagaland and only after 1940 did Nagaland have its first three towns in Kohima, Dimapur and Mokokchung. By 1981, 16 percent of the population was living in urban areas and for the next twenty years, no major shift was noticeable. The decade 2001-2011 saw a remarkable increase in urban population and it increased by 2.2 lakhs, a decadal increase of 67 percent. Rural

population on the other hand declined by 15 percent over the same period. The urban population of Nagaland in 2011 was 28.86 percent, only slightly short of the national average. The differences in rural and urban population do not merely reflect how many people live in villages and how many in cities. It is also one of the indicators, determining whether the state is moving from an agricultural based economy to an industry based economy. Nagaland still has an agriculture based economy where 45.47 percent of its total workforce is employed. However, in the decade between 2001 and 2011, Nagaland recorded the highest growth rate of urbanization of 69 percent which is spectacular when compared to the 21 percent of the national average. About this spectacular urbanization, a government document reports thus:

...the urbanization pattern is somewhat skewed as the urban growth is concentrated in few key towns such as Dimapur and Kohima. Further the urban settlers are mostly the educated people, especially youth with problems of livelihood and employment. Further the towns and cities are confronted by significant long-term challenges such as the abnormal demographic change, climate change, lack of basic amenities including shortage of housing and lack of economic activities such as industries. The qualities of delivery of services in the existing urban areas are further highly deficient. Many towns are in a stage of transition from rural to urban without possessing the requisite urban attributes. Within this existing scenario, the issue of urban poverty is emerging as another complex phenomenon due to lack of access to basic services, education, employment, housing...<sup>13</sup>

In developing economies, a matter of great concern is the falling sex ratio. For Nagaland too, this was a matter of concern. In 1941, the female population was larger than the male population. From there on, the female population went steadily down until 1981 when the gap between male and female population widened to over 7 percent. After that the gap started decreasing and the sex ratio improved marginally. Between 2001 and 2011, the male population decreased in absolute terms by 22492 heads whereas the female population increased by 10958 heads and the gap between male and female population decreased. Once again in absolute terms, male and female population decreased in the rural areas and increased in urban areas. The increase in female population in the cities was more pronounced than the increase in male population contributing to another kind of problem which is unemployment of literate youth.

In 2016, youth comprised 30 percent of the population in Nagaland with 6.82 lakh youth in the age group between 15 and 29 years. Nagaland's proportion of youth composition is higher than the national average of 27 percent. According to Vision 2030, annually Nagaland is envisaged to produce 13000 young people who are job ready. The government sector can only accommodate 3000 to 3500 annually. Where will the rest of the young people go? This is a huge question among the administration in Nagaland. Traditionally, state versus community conflicts had engaged thousands of youth who are now coming back to the workforce. Yet resources are still scarce and both industry and infrastructure are still lagging behind. Competition over resources has now brought communities in conflict with other communities and the state is no longer the main target. A pertinent question at this point can be how logistical disparities have transformed the traditional state versus community conflict into perpetual tension between the communities.

## **New Conflicts: The Case of Migration**

A visit to the city of Dimapur will reveal some of the fissures appearing in Naga society. Dimapur is the ancient capital of the Kachari kingdom. Dimapur became the eighth district of Nagaland in 1997 when it was carved out of Kohima. The only rail station and airport in the state is located in

Dimapur. In 2001, Dimapur had a total population of 308382 persons of whom 166335 were male and 142047 were female. In 2011, that number grew to 378811 of whom 197394 were male and 181417 were female. Even when Nagaland was going through a phase of attrition in population, the population of Dimapur was steadily growing. Dimapur is 74 km away from Kohima. It is considered as the commercial capital of the state. It is a busy vibrant hub with businessmen, hotels, shopkeepers and migrants. It is also precisely because of this cosmopolitanism that Dimapur presents a very unique demography, effecting multiple fault lines, fissures and frictions. Being situated on the plains, Dimapur does not require from travellers or tourists, the much debated Inner Line Permit (ILP) which is required if one wants to visit Kohima, the state capital. Hence, Dimapur also provides an easy entrance and transit point. Does this create angst among the Nagas?

While the general consensus is that the Naga society promotes friendship and welcomes everyone, yet, the angst is there and so is the palpable tension regarding migrants 'taking over' jobs especially in the commercial capital that otherwise belongs to the indigenous tribal people of the state. This is the view that can be discerned after an interaction with the local indigenous population; often they were not direct, but the implications remain clear. If one looks at the informal labour in much of Dimapur, it is difficult to find a person belonging to the Naga tribes. Most of them are Hindi speaking and hail from Bihar.<sup>17</sup> One scholar reported on this after long conversations with some of the informal labourers on their work conditions, unions and the relation they share with the Nagas. The narratives were interesting from both sides - the migrant workers as well as the locals. The construction labourers in brick kilns are mostly migrant workers. The shops across the streets also mostly belong to or are run by non-Nagas. In fact, most hotels in Dimapur are also staffed by non-Nagas. Hotel Cedar, near the Railway station of Dimapur, is famous for its mainland cuisine and the kitchen is run by two Bengalis. Bipul Talukdar, who happens to be the main chef, has a clear Bengali accent and hails from Kolkata. He has been living in Dimapur for 30 years with his family. The other Bengali chef was originally from Silchar, then his family settled in Karimganj in Assam and finally he came to Dimapur in search of work. Since then he has been closely working with the owner of the Hotel, an MLA in the state. At this point we are left with a host of questions: how does one label someone as migrant? Are they illegal immigrants, or legal migrants? How is the journey from illegality to legality determined? Are they allowed to live in the state and earn a living even if they are not illegal immigrants from Bangladesh (colloquially referred to as 'Illegal Bangladeshi Migrants'-IBIs in Nagaland) or does the allegation of non-Nagas taking over jobs in Dimapur include these people as well as those who have been living in Nagaland for decades now? In an ethnographic fieldwork, the authors asked these questions both to migrant labourers like shopkeepers in Dimapur and to groups like the 'Survival Nagaland' fighting for rights of indigenous people.<sup>18</sup>

'Survival Nagaland' is a new group or forum of activists that speaks for the rights and dignity of labour of indigenous people of the Nagaland state. In an interview, some of the important members of this organisation shared not only their thoughts but some of their documents as well which indicate, according to them, the astronomical figure of illegal migrants in the state, particularly in Dimapur. According to their allegations, for instance, some market areas like the New Market area are dominated by mostly migrant communities. Daniele Swu, who is one of the important members of Survival Nagaland, said that the forum was first formed in Mokokchung District of Nagaland in 2007, which traditionally is home to the Ao tribe, one of the most educated, advanced and progressive tribes of Nagaland. In fact, most government jobs in Nagaland are traditionally held by members of the Ao tribe and the title Jamir is common among the IAS officers.<sup>19</sup> As per the 2011 census, the literacy rate of Mokokchung was 91.62 percent, the highest among all districts of Nagaland. One therefore can't help but ponder at this stage whether because of unemployment being

a big problem in Nagaland, for which even educated youths do not have many opportunities other than government jobs, that a forum such as Survival Nagaland that is against migrants labourers was formed in Mokokchung. The two key demands of the organisation are to introduce Inner Line Permit in Dimapur and reinstate the dignity of labour of / among the Nagas. According to this group, there are 5 lakh illegal immigrants from Bangladesh living in the state. In a letter to the Governor of Nagaland, members of Survival Nagaland wrote:

The objective of Survival Nagaland (SN) Movement (SNM) is to create a mass awareness campaign on the dangers posed by the presence of IBIs by reaching out to every individual, colonies, villages, NGOs, mass-based organisations, and churches of the state. It believes that such a campaign should be educative in nature, peaceful, and non-violent by highlighting the possible devastating consequences if the influx of IBIs is allowed to go unabated. That this trend if allowed to continue shall cause much havoc and generate social disorder, thereby transforming our political, demographic and socio-economic landscape irreparably.<sup>20</sup>

The forum does not have any office and at the moment is maintaining a low profile because most of their members have been blacklisted by the government after the public lynching of a migrant in Diphupar, which is 4 miles away from Dimapur town. On 5 March 2015, a huge crowd in the Dimapur district of Nagaland marched to the Dimapur special jail, dragged out a 35 year old man, Syed Farid Khan, lynched him and killed him. On 23 and 24 February, the man had allegedly raped a 20 year old Naga college student. After the incident took place, it was further alleged that the man was an illegal immigrant from Bangladesh. The media alleged that it was not merely a rape case but the rape might have been a trigger:

Soon after the incident came to the fore, the alleged rapist was arrested by the police and lodged in the high-security Dimapur Central Jail. But it was not enough to douse the anger among the people. They found it hard to accept that an 'outsider' dared to commit such a crime on a local Naga girl. There was already great discontent over the increasing population of alleged illegal migrants from Bangladesh in Nagaland. The influx of people from outside the state has deprived many natives of Nagaland of employment. Opportunities to start businesses have also shrunk and there is stiff competition from the said migrants. The combination of factors accounted for deep resentment against the 'outsiders' among the residents of Dimapur.<sup>21</sup>

On 8 March, the lynched man's brother came out publicly to dispel the notion that he was a IBI and said that two of his brothers were in the Indian Army while his father was in the Indian Air Force. It was also found out that the alleged rape victim was known to the family as the cousin of the wife of the man who allegedly raped her.<sup>22</sup> Dimapur is a crucial place for understanding social governance because the widespread social unrest over migrants can be seen as engineered through social governance. The Aos were privileged during the conflict because they clearly opposed the NSCN (IM). But in the post-conflict situation, they have lost their pre-eminence leading to resource dearth and xenophobia.

Another member of Survival Nagaland Remponi spoke to one of the authors of this paper about illegal migrant women taking up prostitution in Dimapur. On 2 May 2017, she took an 8 persons group to file a complaint with the Deputy Commissioner of Dimapur on how illegal prostitution is on the rise in the new market area by Muslim migrant women. Remponi's group called themselves the 'Forum for the concerned citizens of Nagaland' and made an official complaint to the DC. They said, "these women stand right in the entrance of the market area and make bad signals.

For these women we are unable to go to the New Market during evenings. Some NGOs are helping them to survive by distributing condoms in free and we have heard these NGOs have governmental backing."<sup>23</sup> There is in fact a huge concern surrounding HIV in Nagaland since the figure of persons suffering from HIV is high. Assuring the group that he will look into the matter, DC Kesonyu Yhome said he will look into the matter but the condoms are being distributed to generate awareness regarding HIV.<sup>24</sup>

Later, Remponi told the respondent that Survival Nagaland is not against mainland Indians going into Nagaland, but their resistance is against Illegal Bangladeshi Immigrants (IBI) and hence, they have written to the governor of Nagaland extensively on how the illegal Bangladeshi migrants are growing in number in Nagaland. But both Remponi and Danielle said that one major problem they face is to decipher who is from mainland India and who is a Bangladeshi. Most Naga activists do not have a proper estimate of the exact number of migrants and Muslims residing in Karimganj in Assam who regularly come into Nagaland. They complained that these people manage to make false certificates like fake driving license and other identity cards, as a result of which they get PRCs, that is, permits to reside in Nagaland. This is the reason why the Naga activists demand Inner Line Permit for Dimapur.<sup>25</sup>

#### The Case of Women

In October 2014, in an article in EPW, Paula Banerjee had suggested that the state is now actively seeking support from Naga women. Here we will continue with the same line of argument. In its programme for development, the state looked upon women, particularly younger women as both its audience and allies. The Government constructed a plethora of policies and strategies in Nagaland towards empowerment of women which were both social and economic. A review of some of the social and political institutions in Nagaland will reveal the nature of gender mainstreaming in development initiatives. "Gender mainstreaming refers to the systematic examination of all general policies and measures, and taking into account their possible effects on the respective situation of men and women when defining and implementing them. This approach considers the promotion of gender equality as a question of promoting long-lasting changes in family structures, in institutional practices and it also concerns men and the whole of society".26 Gender mainstreaming in development initiatives in post conflict societies is considered as an effective tool of non-traditional security approaches and sustainable approach in reconstruction. The participation of women in former political spaces is still negligible in Nagaland. The Indian Constitution guarantees the participation of women in electoral politics through 73rd and 74th amendment passed in 1992 and 1993, whereby a total of 33 per cent of reservation of seats for women candidates have been provided at the Panchayati Raj elections. But often women civil society leaders look at women politicians with suspicion. Therefore, there is a chasm in the women's movement and the women representative of the PRIs.

One of the newer innovations for getting support of the Naga women on the side of the administration is the formation of the Department of Women's Development. This department has entered into a partnership with apex women Hohos in all the districts. The partner NGOs have been instrumental in implementing various schemes of the Department. The main thrust of the department was to encourage and strengthen women centered Self Help Groups (SHGs). The Annual Administrative Report of 2011-2012 outlined the following as the primary focus of the department: 1. To better the socio-economic status of women; 2. To safeguard the rights of women; 3. To provide support services. A total outlay of Rs. 1025 lakh has been provided by the State to

implement ongoing programmes of the department.<sup>27</sup> Some of the activities which are in relation with the spirit of CEDAW and UNSCR 1325 include the formation of:-

- 1. Nagaland State Commission for Women: This Commission was created to safeguard women's rights and to promote their empowerment through the Nagaland Women Commission Act, 2006. As per provision of this Act, the Commission consisting of a Chairperson and two members was constituted in 2007-2008.
- 2. Nagaland State Social Welfare Board: A new scheme called Integrated Scheme for Women Empowerment was launched by the board to support SHGs.
- 3. Grant in Aid to NGOs: The Department has worked out a system whereby it has partnered with the apex women's organizations (Hohos) in each district. Under this partnership, selected NGOs are assisting the Department in implementation, verification and supervision of the schemes and activities of the Department. The Department closely coordinates with these partner NGOs and assists them in their work on rehabilitation and support of women in difficult circumstances, including women in extreme poverty, destitute and deserted women, women in conflict situations, women affected by natural calamities, physically and mentally challenged women etc.
- 4. Financial assistance to destitute women: Destitute women are provided with a financial assistance of Rs 200 per month. In 2011-2012, 3000 women received the financial assistance.
- 5. Establishment of Rehabilitation cum Support Centre: A Rehabilitation cum Support centre has been set up at Purana Bazar for catering to the special needs of the commercial sex workers, HIV/AIDS affected women, victims of sexual exploitation and marital violence, deserted women and victims of trafficking. The services being provided include training in various trades and alternative livelihood, free legal aid, counseling and spiritual guidance.
- 6. Implementation of Acts: With the enforcement of *The Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act, 2005*, the State Government has approved the designation of EACs as Protection Officers and the Nagaland State Social Welfare Board as the Service Provider under the Act. The Prodigal's Home in Dimapur has been designated as the "state shelter home" to provide shelter and counseling to victims of domestic violence.

Most of these developmental programmes started in 2004-2005, but at that time, Naga women were still reeling from the effects of conflict. However, even in the midst of trying to cope with the effects of conflict they were articulating their desire for a better, more prosperous life. In the traditional scheme of things, strategically women used their gender roles to intervene in the masculinised realm of state policy. Women also often make strategic use of gender roles to enter the masculinised space of conflict. Motherhood can be viewed as such a strategy. Various women's organisations have played a key role in translating their "traditional" roles as "mothers" to social and political agents and have successfully used the social sanction of being a "protector" that "motherhood" offers. "Motherhood" has been time and again evoked to challenge the masculinist discourse of nationhood. The image of "motherhood" and "nation-building" can be seen as problematic as most of the debates centre around "natural", innate qualities of women as mothers and often challenge the feminist discourse where "motherhood" is seen as performative, a product. It is important to see what roles are used for peace making. Most of the feminist writings on Mother's Groups have been critical about the stance of the groups where a women's political negotiation in a conflict situation is drawn from her "emotional" attachment as mothers to sons and daughters who have died or are potential victims. According to Malathi de Alwis, by appealing as Mothers, the state defined role for women, they reveal the contradictions between the state's own rhetoric and practices. In her discussion on Mother's Front, Malathi de Alwis argues that "by appealing for a return to the "natural" order of family and motherhood, these women were openly embracing patriarchal stereotypes that primarily defined them through familial/domestic subject positions such as wife and mother". Through this acceptance, Malathi de Alwis argues, they were revealing the transgression of the state that otherwise valorises women as mothers but were now "denying women opportunities for mothering, through a refusal to acknowledge life by resorting to clandestine tactics of disappearance." Why then do so many women use "motherhood" to enter peace politics? This is because it is regarded as one of the "tolerated" spaces of protest by women. Once entering the masculine space of conflict, how well women subvert it to build solidarities is portrayed by women's activism for peace in Northeast India.

The most notable of the Naga women's peace groups are the Naga Mothers Association (NMA) and they been very active in the politics for peace in Northeast India. The NMA has rendered valuable service for the cause of peace. It came into existence on February 14, 1984, with a preamble that stated, "Naga mothers of Nagaland shall express the need of conscientizing citizens toward more responsible living and human development through the voluntary organisation of the Naga Mothers Association."<sup>29</sup> Membership of NMA is open to any adult Naga women irrespective of whether she is married or single. Members can join through the women's organisations of their own tribes. The organisation encourages human development through education and it attempts to eradicate social evils and economic exploitations and work towards peace and progress. The NMA mediated between the Government of Nagaland and the Naga Student's Federation over age limit for jobs and came to an equitable settlement. An achievement of NMA is the formation of the Peace Team in October 1994 to confront the deteriorating political situation. Their theme was Shed No. More Blood. The NMA spoke against killings not only by the army but also by the militants. In a pamphlet released on 25th May, 1995, the representatives of NMA wrote that "the way in which our society is being run whether by the overground government or the underground government, has become simply intolerable." The NMA celebrates the 12th of May each year as the Mother's Day and renews their appeal for peace. Apart from peace initiatives, the NMA has worked for social regeneration.

The traditional form of women's activism was undertaken in certain particular ways. None of these women's groups worked for issues that seemed relevant only for women. They may have been concerned about women's rights or gender roles in society but that was not the focus of their campaigns. Their campaign issues were larger political and human rights issues. Their mode of campaigning was also different in the sense that it was all about building solidarities. They inevitably worked with other groups and solidarities such as the human rights groups, student groups, the Hohos etc. They did not believe in doing it alone and for them the larger adversary was the Indian State. Their contest was always with the state or state like structures. Therefore they tried to keep social tensions to a minimum. Much of their activism was posited on the pillar of state versus community conflict. They critiqued most types of developmental projects as foreign and refused to participate in the project of "shining" India.

With the state versus community conflict receding, newer fractures are however appearing. One such fracture is the difference of opinion between generations. The other relates to growing disparity between regions or districts of Nagaland. With the traditional conflict going into background, new contentious gendered issues are coming up that are putting women and men in contest with each other and the state is appearing as the new arbiter. In the traditional governing system under the village council or informal council of elders, women were excluded from decision

making. Today, the Village Development Board that has governing powers in the villages and forms the Village Councils has to allocate 25 per cent of its fund for women only and employ female representatives to administer as has been ordained by the state powers. In Village Councils, there are very few female chairpersons. Tokheli Kikon is the first female Village Council Chairperson in Nagaland. Tokheli Kikon initially started off as a social worker and village council member of Naharbari Village, Dimapur. She recalls that in 2005, when she contested the village council election, she was the only female candidate contesting against three male candidates. She recalls with pride that out of 21 votes, she received 13 votes and there were 2 absent votes. After she became the Village Council Chairperson, she ensured that 25 per cent of the Village Development Board fund is utilized solely for the women's unit of the village. She said her motto was "work and eat". Under the National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme fund, she encouraged villagers to focus on drainage system of the village. She also restored the water body close to the village and encouraged villagers to take up pisciculture, which is one of the major sources of livelihood for men and women.<sup>30</sup> Women are taking up these examples, showing that women in decision making roles can bring forth real changes. Mrs. Vamuza, the Chairperson of Naga Women's Commission in 2009, also felt that the women's groups need to generate awareness about the Government of Nagaland, Land Revenue Department's efforts to make participation of women mandatory in Village Council / Village Development Board. In a Memorandum (No LR/1-1/94), the government has announced that women will have a separate share in Village Development Board fund. Some women have even used this fund to buy land for themselves and given a rest to the myth that Naga women do not own land. Perhaps the most dramatic of women's contests in Nagaland with State support today is over the question of 33 per cent electoral representation. Women are poorly represented in formal decision making processes in Nagaland including the village, regional and national levels. To facilitate women's participation in the political process and involve them in decision making, the Government of Nagaland passed the Nagaland Municipal Act of 2001, the Amendment of 2006, and the 108 Amendment Act or Women's Reservation Bill of 2008. The Nagaland State Commission for Women is an apex organization meant to look after the needs of Naga women. In 2009, Mrs. Sano Vamuzo<sup>31</sup>, who was the chairperson at that time and also one of the founder members of NMA, pointed out that there is a need to generate awareness about women's role in decision making bodies by encouraging them to participate in electoral politics. She cited two instances of state efforts for women's engagement in political spaces, the state's initiative to ensure 33 per cent reservation for women in local bodies. She recalled the commission's efforts to bring together various civil society actors on 13 February 2009 and the house unanimously adopted two resolutions: 1. In favour of immediate support for the Women's Reservation Bill; and 2. the reservation of seats for women as per the Nagaland Municipal Council Amendment Act 2006.

Yet during the Mokokchung Municipal Elections of 2008, this bill could not be implemented as women filing nomination papers were stopped by volunteers from 16 wards of Mokokchung town arguing that reservation of seats for women was irrelevant for Aos as it was against customary law.<sup>32</sup> The situation got so bad that the women under the leadership of NMA went in for a litigation asking for implementation of the bill. When the Municipal and Town elections were postponed as a result of controversy over Women's Reservation Bill, the women asked the court to continue with the election and implement the reservation bill under article 243 T(3) of the Indian Constitution and Section 23 A of the Nagaland Municipal (First Amendment) Act 2006. Even the Chief Minister of Nagaland supported the women in his speech on 8 October 2010 when he said that there is "a commonly held view amongst some Nagas that traditionally women do not have any role in public governance in Naga society. However, it is also gratifying to note that many

enlightened people in the State no longer subscribe to this view. In modern times, societies which do not accord an equitable and honorable status to their women are considered to be backward, underdeveloped or even primitive."<sup>33</sup> The women petitioners including Rosemary Dzuvichu and Aboiu Meru representing the NMA won this case and Article 35 of court order stated that elections be undertaken by 20 Janury 2012, honouring the 33 per cent stipulation for women. However, this did not happen either.

Women's activism over 33 per cent electoral representation portrays the appearance of new forms of activism for Naga women. No longer were questions of sovereignty allowed to push questions of women's rights under the carpet. With conflict shifting from people's immediate memory there was no longer any justification to gloss over other rivalries, be they on the basis of ethnicity, location or gender. In these contests, the people are going to the state machinery for arbitration and the state is also allying with certain groups to facilitate governance. An IAS officer clearly said that NMA was always welcome in their offices as they think of them as allies in their good work.<sup>34</sup>

## The Age Gap

One of the major differences between the traditional protest movements in the state and new forms is the fact that while the old or traditional protest movements focused on representing the entire Naga community, beyond the geographical demarcation of Naga territory, the new protest movements talk in favour of only Nagas living within the state. Also, the newer groups have found out non violent ways of protests, albeit rigid in their demands, in contrast to the old militant protests. In Morung Express, Aheli Maitra, one of the leading journalists spoke on how governance in Nagaland is emanating from the ground zero. Among other problems, Aheli talked about extortion being a great challenge in Nagaland. In fact there are many among the younger generation who feel that extortion and illegal taxation are the two most vital challenges of Nagaland in the current times.<sup>35</sup> Pradip Phanjoubam, a leading journalist from Manipur, addressed this issue at length and wrote about the social friction in Nagaland resulting mainly from a conflict between tradition and modernity. To this, Aheli, representing largely the youth activists, said, "We don't agree with the notion that Pradip Phanjoubam adheres to, like grand narratives on clashes between modernity and traditions or clashes between civilisations and things like that. There are many nuanced negotiations that go on in the ground. India doesn't recognise the category called indigenous people, indigeneity of people. But whether there is an acceptance or not, the indigeneity does exist here and whenever a new policy is pushed, that needs to find resonance with the ground. So, it's not as if people are resisting against the reservation, or that there is a denial, it's not as simple. On the reservation policy, constant negotiation is going on between individuals, sects etc. Negotiation is extremely important; it's important how these negotiations are going on."36 What she clearly meant was that the way the issue has shaped in most mainstream media houses of India does not reflect the reality. Any policy to be pushed in Naga society where customary laws are in vogue following Art. 371 A of the Indian Constitution, granting special status to the state of Nagaland, should be done with caution and care. The resistance to the issue of reservation that resulted into a nullification of the February 2017 urban municipality elections in Nagaland had also happened on the ground that the government was basically trying to push a copy paste act from other states. The issue of 33 percent votes for women also has got caught up in this debate between age groups.

A well known human rights activist of Nagaland, Neingulo Krome, representing the older generation, spoke of this age gap leading to a failure of the older generation to speak to the younger generation and convince them about the necessity and efficacy of their struggle. He said:

...people of the National movement have also terribly failed on its part in molding and shaping the minds of today's generation, who have come to think we are also secessionist. This is not your fault at all. This is because everybody has become too luxurious and too comfortable with the ceasefires. But this is not an isolated case of the Nagas. This happens in any conflict situation when ceasefires are prolonged for too long. And fearing this may happen to the Nagas too, some of us right from the early stages of the ceasefires have been making suggestion to the National groups to use the space of the ceasefire to create awareness on Naga political movement with the masses and particularly the younger generation. But all of us who belong to the generation prior to the ceasefires are equally to be blamed. Because all of us has failed to do our parts of the responsibilities and are only blaming each other just as I am doing today.<sup>37</sup>

Another angst that the younger or post ceasefire generation has about the older activists has been well described by Bano Haralu, who talked about the connectivity issue as a major issue in Nagaland. The roads are in bad condition and there is lack of public transportation as well. This is something that everyone experiences in their visits to Nagaland, trying to commute between places. So in order to logistically connect the Southeast Asia with India, through the Northeast, the need of the hour is to first develop inner connectivity; only then can interconnectivity work. Bano, who is associated with NDTV for many years, says that policies like the Look East or Act East exist in papers mostly.<sup>38</sup> There are other issues like growing unemployment and illegal taxation against which groups like Survival Nagaland and ACAUT are fighting. A leading member of ACAUT, Simon Kelio while talking about their organisation said that "it is more like a forum of social activists that has achieved a lot of popularity in Nagaland." Their platform is known as 'Against Corruption and Unabated Taxation' (ACAUT). Simon himself is the Vice Principal of S.M. College and is also the chairman of his colony known as the Residency Colony. He, along with his fellow members had lodged a case against the government for illegal taxation, following which a high power committee was formed to probe into these charges. In a rally on 25 August 2017, ACAUT warned the Nagaland government that:

The most decisive battle in the 'War Against Corruption' is at hand and thus, it stated, while claiming that the process to cement people's efforts to reclaim Nagaland is already underway. "This generation must stand up for the coming generation; the people especially in the towns and districts head quarters must stand up for the people in the hinterland who are counting on them," it urged. The ACAUT Nagaland urged the Nagaland State Government not to test the patience of the people and fool around but to wisely heed to the demands of the people before the deadline expires. At the end, the people are only demanding their constitutional right to live in dignity, it said.<sup>39</sup>

From this statement of ACAUT, it is clear that they associate themselves with today's generation. Their concern is not a unified Nagaland but the everyday issues of bread and butter, corruption, resources etc.

#### Conclusion

The state versus community conflict led to a fairly stable ceasefire in 1997. That conflict unified much of the Naga opinion. People sacrificed much of their personal interest for the cause of

nationalism. The state was starved of much of its resources but the people bore it with pride as they believed they were in a nationalist battle. The older generation of the Nagas considered that they had always been a sovereign people that the GOI colonized. They considered this colonialism unjust. The Nagas often referred back to the referendum of the 1950s when supposedly 99.9 percent Nagas voted for freedom. This particular conflict unified the Naga people as never before. But even then, there were fissures in society and some factional fighting. But now that conflict is all but over and the cementing factor of nationalism is no longer effective. Hence, a number of other contests are affecting the Naga people. These contests are between the settled and the migrants, between ethnicities, between generations and between genders, and interestingly the state is progressively appearing as an arbiter to these conflicts rather than as a party to it. One of the reasons for this is because the state has from the 1990s interspersed counter insurgency with development. Also, it has skillfully and successfully marketed its developmental agenda through the so-called Look East Policy. The state now needs allies from among the people of Northeast to pursue its Look East Policy. Hence, such a great stress has been placed on the developmental agenda and creating for itself a reputation of provider of justice and good governance. This is apparent from its Vision 2030. One initial line of the document says, "Without Peace and Good Governance no Vision or perspective plan can be put into place. Hence the Vision is written with the anticipation that peace will prevail as an outcome of the early settlement of the Naga political problem now that a Framework of Agreement has been arrived at."40

During the time of conflict, the GOI doled few resources to their allies in Nagaland such as the Aos. But with the conflict over, the state has found newer allies. The older allies are therefore now finding themselves in an oppositional relation to the state. The newer generation is allied with the state against what they perceive of as evil such as corruption. But logistical framework that can pacify Naga people's demands for development is yet to be put in place. However, the community versus community conflicts are dissipating much of people's energy so that they are not able to make unified claims. The state is happy to act as the grand arbiter doling out promises to different communities. But does that mean Nagaland is at peace? This is a question that can be answered only in the future.

#### Notes

NOL

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Shri Kuladhar Chaliha, in *The Constituent Assembly Debates*, vol. IX, Tuesday, 6 September 1949, pp. 1-2 of 20, http://parliamentofindia.nic.in/debates/vol9p27a.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Shri Brajeshwar Prasad, in *The Constituent Assembly Debates*, vol. IX, Tuesday, 6 September 1949, p. 3 of 20, http://parliamentofindia.nic.in/debates/vol9p27a.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Shri Gopinath Bordoloi, in *The Constituent Assembly Debates*, vol. IX, Tuesday, 8 September 1949, p 4 of 26, http://parliamentofindia.nic.in/debates/vol9p27a.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Khatoli Khala, *The Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act and its Impact on Women in Nagaland* (New Delhi, WISCOMP, March 2003) p. 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Samir Kumar Das, "India's Look East Policy: Imagining a New Geography of India's Northeast." *India Quaterly, Vol. 64, No. 4*, 2010, p. 344.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> S.M. Krishna, MEA Document, GOI, 27 June, 2011 in Vaidyanathan Shivkumar and Jose Ernesto Rangel Delgado, "Look East Policy of India: The Myths and Realities" *Portes: Revista Mexicana de Estudios Sabre La Cuenca Del Pacifico, 1 July, 2011, Vol. 5, Issue 10*, p. 117.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> All information presented in this paragraph is attributed to a report prepared by FICCI and KPMG entitled, *Emerging North-East India: Economically and Socially Inclusive Development Strategies*, November 2015, KPMG.com/in.

- <sup>8</sup> All information in this section is taken from Gorky Chakraborty, "India's Look East and the North East: Building Partners or Creating Pathways," Omeo Kumar Das Institute of Social Change and Development, Research Paper Series 5/2012.
- <sup>9</sup> FICCI and KPMG, Emerging North-East India: Economically and Socially Inclusive Development Strategies, November 2015, KPMG.com/in, p. 17.
- <sup>10</sup> Authors' interviews with Mamta Agarwal and Archana Thakur, Joint Secretary UGC, New Delhi, 17 July 2017.
- <sup>11</sup>Human Development Report of North East States, December 2011, Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region, New Delhi, GOI, <a href="www.mdoner.gov.in">www.mdoner.gov.in</a>
- <sup>12</sup> "Nagaland," *State Human Development Report, 2004*, Department of Planning and Coordination, Government of Nagaland, October 2004, pp. 241-242,
- <sup>13</sup>Nagaland Vision 2030, Government of Nagaland,
- file:///D:/RLS/Nagaland%20Paper/Nagaland%20Vision%20Document%202030.pdf, accessed on 7 July 2017.
- <sup>14</sup> Ibid, p. 25.
- <sup>15</sup> "Nagaland," *State Human Development Report, 2004*, Department of Planning and Coordination, Government of Nagaland, October 2004, p. 241.
- <sup>16</sup>Basic Statistics of North Eastern Region, 2015, A Report From North Eastern Council Secretariat, Nogrim Hills, Shillong, GOI, p. 105.
- <sup>17</sup> Sucharita Sengupta reported on this after her trip to Nagaland during May 1-10, 2017.
- 18 Ibid
- <sup>19</sup> Sucharita Sengupta, interview with Daniele Swu, Dimapur, 3 May 2017.
- <sup>20</sup> Survival Nagaland, Letter to the Governor dated 23/06/15 no. SNM/01/R/15, Dimapur, Nagaland. Available in MCRG archives, Cat No. DC/NE/MCRG/218, Salt Lake, Kolkata.
- <sup>21</sup> Simantil Dowerah, "It's not just about rape: Why 10,000 people lynched one man in Dimapur," *Firstpost*, 7 March 2015, http://www.firstpost.com/india/its-not-just-about-rape-why-10000-people-lynched-one-man-in-dimapur-2139497.html, accessed on 9 July 2017.
- <sup>22</sup> Urmi Bhattacharjee, "Nagaland Lynching: Questions Raised Over Killing of Alleged Rapist, Brother Cries Foul," NDTV, 8 March 2015, http://www.ndtv.com/india-news/nagaland-lynching-questions-raised-over-killing-of-alleged-rapist-brother-cries-foul-744794, accessed on 9 July 2017.
- <sup>23</sup> Sucharita Sengupta's interaction with Remponi, 2 May, 2017, Dimapur, Nagaland.
- <sup>24</sup> Sucharita Sengupta's interview with DC Kesonyu Yhome, 2 May, 2017, Dimapur, Nagaland.
- <sup>25</sup> Sucharita Sengupta's interview with Remponi, 4 May 2017, Dimapur, Nagaland.
- <sup>26</sup> Myrium Gervais, "Experiences of Women During and After Violent Conficts: Implications for Women in South Asia, in Shree Mullay and Jackie Kirk, eds. *Women Building Peace Between India and Pakistan,* (Anthem Critical Studies, Kolkata, 2007) p. 161.
- <sup>27</sup> Annual Administrative Report 2012, Department of Women Development, Nagaland, Kohima, p1-2.
- <sup>28</sup> Malathi de Alwis, "Motherhood as a Space of Protest: Women's Political Participation in Contemporary Sri Lanka," in Paula Banerjee ed, *Women in Peace Politics* (Sage, New Delhi, 2008).
- <sup>29</sup>Constitution of the Naga Mother's Association, Reprinted in Kohima, 1992.
- <sup>30</sup> Interview of the author with Tokheli Kikon, Dimapur, 30 February 2012.
- <sup>31</sup> Interview with Sano Vamuzo, Chairperson, Nagaland State Commission for Women, 6 August 2009.
- <sup>32</sup>Nagaland State Human Development Report, (Department of Planning and Coordination, Government of Nagaland, October 2004) pp. 103-104.
- <sup>33</sup> Court Judgment on Women's Reservation Bill Nagaland p. 4. Gwahati High Court, WP (C) No. 147 (K) 2011, Judgement dated 21 October 2011. The author received a copy of the judgment courtesy NMA
- <sup>34</sup> Inteview with Ramaiah Ramakrishnan, Kohima, 3 March 2012.
- <sup>35</sup> Sucharita Sengupta's interview with Aheli Maitra on 4 March 2017, Dimapur, Nagaland.
- <sup>36</sup> Ibid.

p.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Neingulo Krome, "A Paper Presentation on Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act, 1958," in a Dialogue and Deliberation, organised by Youngs Club Dimapur, at Hotel Acacia Conference Hall on the 25th of November, 2014 at Dimpur. Copy of the speech handed by Krome to Paula Banerjee.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Sucharita Sengupta's discussion with Bano Haralo, 5 May, 2017, Kohima, Nagaland.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> "ACAUT urges Nagaland govt to adopt '7-point resolution", nelive, Dimapur, 30 August 2017, https://www.nelive.in/nagaland/news/acaut-urges-nagaland-govt-adopt-%E2%80%987-point-resolution%E2%80%99, accessed on 1 September 2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>Nagaland Vision 2030, Government of Nagaland,

# **CRG** Series on Policies and Practices

- 74. Cities, Rural Migrants & the Urban Poor-III: Migration & the Urban Question in Delhi
- 75. Classes, People, and Populism
- 76. Logistical Space I: Logistics and Social Governance
- 77. Logistical Space II: Mobilities and Spaces
- 78. Logistical Space III: Hubs, Connectivity and Transit
- 79. Logistical Space IV: The Asam Paradigm
- 80. People, Politics and Protests I: Calcutta & West Bengal, 1950s 1960s
- 81. People, Politics and Protests II: Bengal and Bihar
- 82. People, Politics and Protests III: Marxian, Literary Debates and Discourses
- 83. The Importance of being Siliguri, or the Lack therof: Border-Effect and the "Untimely" City in North Bengal
- 84. Logistical Space V: Representations of Connectivity
- 85. Logistical Space VI: Logistics and the Reshaping of Global Governance
- 86. Logistical Space VII: Finance Capital & Infrastructure Development
- 87. Logistical Space VIII: Trade, Capital & Conflict

#### **CRG Series on Policies and Practices**

- 31 Local Dynamics, Universal Context: Border Trading through Moreh, Manipur
- 32 Two Studies on Asylum Seekers and Other Immigrants in Finland
- 33 Endangered Lives on The Border: Women in the Northeast
- 34 Globalisation and Labouring Lives
- 35 Right to Information in a Globalising World
- 36 Bengal-Bangladesh Border and Women
- 37 Between Ecology and Economy: Environmental Governance in India
- 38 Incomplete Citizenship, Statelessness and Human Trafficking: A Preliminary Analysis of The Current Situation in West Bengal, India
- 39 Place of Poor in Urban Space
- 40 Law and Democratic Governance: Two Studies from Europe
- 41 Finding a Point of Return: Internally Displaced Persons in Sri Lanka
- 42 Colonialism, Resource Crisis and Forced Migration
- 43 Situating Transit Labour
- 44 Two Essays on Security Apparatus
- 45 Governing Flood, Migration and Conflict in North Bihar
- 46 A Gigantic Panopticon: Counter-Insurgency and Modes of Disciplining and Punishment in Northeast India
- 47 Public Interest Litigation in India: Implications for Law and Development
- 48 Governing Caste and Managing Conflicts-Bihar, 1990-2011
- 49 Emerging Spaces and Labour Relations in Neo-Liberal India
- 50 Peace by Governance or Governing Peace? A Case Study of the United Liberation Front of Assam (ULFA)
- 51 Women, Conflict and Governance in Nagaland
- 52 Tripura: Ethnic Conflict, Militancy & Counterinsurgency
- 53 Government of Peace
- 54 Bengal Borders and Travelling Lives
- 55 Financialisation, Labour Market Flexibility, and Global Crisis
- 56 The Chronicle of a Forgotten Movement: 1959 Food Movement Revisited
- 57 The Religious Nature of Our Political Rites
- 58. Social Impact of the City Planning Machinery: Case Study of Road-Widening in Bangalore
- 59. In Search of Space: The Scheduled Caste Movement in West Bengal after Partition
- 60. Stateless in Law: Two Assessments
- 61. Failed by Design?: The Limitations of Statebuilding
- 62. Contesting Ideas on Peace (A Report & Some Reflections)
- 63. Body/Law/Technology: The Political Implications of Society as Apparatus
- 64. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-I: An Overview
- 65. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-II: War, Debt, and Reconstruction of Economy
- 66. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-III: The Arab Question in Post-Colonial France
- 67. Accumulation under Post-Colonial Capitalism-IV: Mobile Labour and the New Urban
- 68. West Bengal-Bangladesh Borders: Humanitarian Issues
- 69. Policing a Riot-torn City: Kolkata, 16-18 August 1946
- 70. Labour, Law and Forced Migration
- 71. Rohingyas in India: Birth of a Stateless Community
- 72. Cities, Rural Migrants & the Urban Poor-I: Migration & the Urban Question in Kolkata
- 73. Cities, Rural Migrants & the Urban Poor-II: Migration & the Urban Question in Mumbai

# CRG Series on Policies and Practices

- 1 People on the Move: How Governments Manage Moving Populations
- 2 Resources for Autonomy Financing the Local Bodies
- 3 Peace Accords as the Basis of Autonomy
- 4 Debates Over Women's Autonomy
- 5 Unequal Communication: Health and Disasters As Issues of Public Sphere
- 6 Globalisation, State Policies And Sustainability of Rights
- 7 Autonomies in the North and the North East: More Freedom or the Politics of Frontier Management?
- 8 Examining Autonomy: The 73rd Constitutional Amendment in Assam
- 9 Democracy, Autonomy and the Community Media
- 10 Women and Forced Migration
- 11 Flags and Rights
- 12 A Status Report on Displacement in Assam and Manipur
- 13 Weapons of the Weak: Field Studies on Claims to Social Justice in Bihar & Orissa
- 14 Towards a New Consideration: Justice for the Minorities
- 15 Conflict, War & Displacement
- 16 The Draft National Rehabilitation Policy: A Critique
- 17 Limits of the Humanitarian: Studies in Situations of Forced Migration
- 18 Prescribed, Tolerated, and Forbidden Forms of Claim Making
- 19 Three Studies on Law and The Shifting Spaces of Justice.
- 20 Primitive Accumulation and Some Aspects of Work and Life in India in The Early Part of The Twenty First Century.
- 21 Citizens, Non-Citizens, and The Stories of Camps
- 22 Tales of Two Cities
- 23 Ways of Power, Minorities, and Knowledge on Minorities: An Assessment of Research Policies and Practices.
- 24 Whither Right to Food? Rights Institutions and Hungry Labour in Tea Plantations of North Bengal
- 25 Hunger, Food Scarcity, & Popular Protests in West Bengal
- 26 Cyclone Aila & the Sundarbans: An Enquiry into the Disaster and Politics of Aid and Relief
- 27 View from India: Media & Minorities in Europe
- 28 Protecting the Rights of the Tsunami Victims: The Sri Lanka Experience
- 29 Nation Building and Minority Alienation in India
- 30 Environment and Migration Purulia, West Bengal

POLICIES AND PRACTICES is the research paper series brought out by the Mahanirban Calcutta Research Group (CRG). Writings under this series can be referred to and used for public educational purposes with due acknowledgment.

