# Venue: Hotel The Sojourn, Kolkata

[Note: Participants' notes presented at the meeting are appended at the end]

(**Participants:** Manish K. Jha, Shalini Randeria, Shyamalendu Majumdar, Arup Kumar Sen, Sabyasachi Basu Ray Chaudhury, Paula Banerjee, Marvi Slathia, Ranabir Samaddar, Aditi Mukherjee, Ria De, K. M. Parivelan, Pragya Khanna, Byasdeb Dasgupta, Bharat Bhushan, Rabin Daw, Pradip Bose, Ratan Chakraborty, Raj Kumar Mahato, Rajat Kanti Sur, Ashok Kumar Giri, Subhas Ranjan Chakraborty, Shibashish Chatterjee, Rajesh Kharat, Rajat Roy, Samaresh Guchhait, Subhashree Rout, Shatabdi Das)

## Discussion

### Day 1: 24 January 2020

#### Brief observations on programme and the collaborative framework

The welcome address was delivered by Ranabir Samaddar, Distinguished Chair in Migration and Forced Migration Studies, Calcutta Research Group. He briefed the participants regarding the plan of the meeting and introduced the programme, mentioning that the 'media' segment would be a new theme in the present year. He explained that the two themes of 'global compact' and 'protection' had culminated into major discussions in the last two years. He commented that the programme was still in inception and the design of the programme for the year would be shaped by the observations of last year's participants and the comments of experts. He thanked the Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung for unstinted support for reviving CRG's programme in migration and forced migration studies, and their constructive suggestions from time to time.

He also informed the participants that in 2020 and 2021 the Institute for Human Sciences (IWM), Vienna also will collaborate with the Calcutta Research Group in some of the new segments of the programme, and together the programme would work towards setting up a joint Europe-Asia research platform for work in migration and forced migration studies. There will emphasis on exploring new issues in gender and migration, various migration crises, issues of cities, refugees and migrants, focus on Afghan and Syrian refugees looking for sanctuaries in European countries; also refusal of sanctuary to refugees by European countries. Comparative studies in all these areas will be encouraged.

The following areas were enlisted for exploration:

- Strategically building a network in Europe of like-minded people who could help expand the network of research. Building a similar network in India to expand upon the European debates.
- Research on the so-called 'invisible migrants' of Europe, South Asian labourers in East Europe, whether to term 'out-of-place' and 'displaced' people as refugees or migrants, issues of citizenship and identity politics in the Indian context.
- 'Refugee Jurisprudence' would be an important aspect of research along with focus on the politics of dismantling of rights and people's experiences of life as refugees or migrants.
- Translating CRG's research into policies and practices through the amalgamation of the work of activists, academics, bridge-courses and exchange programmes.
- Studies on labour market, naturalisation in Europe, bindings of solidarity across the globe and the boundaries of exclusion or dispossession and inclusion in India in terms of protection.

#### Brief report of migration workshops and conferences (2018 and 2019)

The concept of this year's programme would take forward the themes of auto-ethnography and interaction with refugees and migrants and publication of their voices, poetry and sketches, aided by the media module. Activities like dissemination through web circulation, comparative studies

between refugee crises in the Indian Ocean and the Mediterranean region, would be taken up together with publication of books, articles, film and reading sessions for encouraging interaction and discussion.

## Discussion by a participant of migration workshop 2019

Some of the ideas that came to the forefront for adding to the existing structure of the programme:

- Two-three days of theme lecture and reading sessions followed by two days of presentations or discussions on the research by workshop participants and two days of conference (one day for young scholars and one day for resource persons).
- Screening of films on refugees, migrants and their struggles of everyday life. Involvement of filmmakers and theatres performances.
- Ground experiences and voices of refugees could be foregrounded.
- Legal framework and citizenship could be thought of as a module.
- Role of social media could be added to the modules like borderland, statelessness; such as the loss of communication for prolonged period in Jammu and Kashmir.

# Structure of the migration workshop and conference 2020: duration, dates, module themes, field visit, creative media activities, evaluation

- The research and orientation workshop and conference dates will be 23-28 November 2020.
- The Publication, circulation of published articles and web based products, participation of urban planners, refugee rights activists, media activists, social media and graphic artists would be given importance.
- The structure would be a three and a half day workshop (pedagogy oriented), half day field visit, two day conference.
- Selection of papers for publication, revision, and the report of the programme would be complete by 31 December 2020.
- Besides theoretical and conceptual aspects, simulation exercises, advocacy and classroom teaching would be emphasised.
- Extension of networks by working with various social organisations, media platforms, universities, and human rights commissions.
- Utilisation of various archives such as the directories of migration studies, archiving new material, holding exhibitions, and film and documentary sessions. The existing CRG compilation of the work of institutes conducting research on refugee rights requires update.
- Visits, discussions and interactions with stakeholders and communities affected by displacement and forced migration.
- CRG's earlier work with Andaman refugees could be extended focusing on the survivors of the refugee families in Andaman.
- A part-time position could be created in CRG to engage a candidate for uploading and updating materials online.

## **Discussion on field visit**

- The possibilities of organising multiple field trips throughout the year and dissemination of the experiences through the publication of research articles, reports and online publication supplemented by visual medium could be one initiative.
- Essay writing on the experiences during field investigation and interactions with migrants and sharing such stories of field trips on online platforms.
- The field visit should look into the evolution of Kolkata as a migrant city. In this connection we have to note the usual perspective of an urban planner who projects a top-down view of the city as if looking from a watch tower. Learning about the lives of Kolkata tannery workers of the Ravidas and Muslim communities of Odisha, Bihar, and Uttar Pradesh, or the significance of the Suriname Ghat a name that recalls the history of indentured labour in the nineteenth century and how it controlled labour trajectory within the city as well as beyond would be important.

## Discussion on creative media activities

- Selection of a couple of young film-makers and orientation through workshop to finish their film project on migration in six months' time.
- Documentation of ongoing movements, marches, gatherings, expression of opinions on social media, posters and slogans, and for this work collaboration with photographers and journalists.
- Intensive fieldwork for capturing the ground truth on protests in rural areas and collection, documentation and archiving of the struggles of people in rural areas.
- Documentary festival, exhibition of photo collection on migration and interaction among visitors could play an important role, especially targeting college and university students as audience.
- Preparation of maps representing the history, migration and routes of the neighbourhoods covered during field visit.
- Political photojournalists such as Shahidul Alam among others could be invited to the programme or else curate their work. The names of Manjit Kriplani and Neelam Deo of the Gateway House came up regarding work on migration maps. Prospects of collaboration for map-making with the GIS Cell at TISS Mumbai and the Faculty of Humanities and Social Science of IIT Kharagpur were discussed. It was suggested that journalist Sadiq Naqvi could be invited to make a presentation on migrants and fear.

## **Research Themes**

It was noted that:

- Protection, refugeehood and citizenship, the concepts of 'alien' and 'the others', media, ethics of care and protection, refugee labour, the issue of resources, and discrimination on grounds of race, religion, and gender in the matter of protection should be taken up as themes of research agenda.
- Likewise, climate change and environmental issues and related displacement should be taken up.

### Media workshop and expected output

It was underscored that:

- The compilation of a handbook for media persons which would provide them with a tool of ready reckoning, supplemented by specific and relevant laws and conventions, was necessary. The prominence of social and digital media and web portal should be taken into consideration in addition to the involvement graduate students and faculty of media study courses and departments at universities and academic institutes.
- It was stressed that conduct of workshops with journalists and media persons, story-telling by migrants and victims of forced migration, and narratives on migration and crime are important. Several themes were listed, for lecture series:
- 1. Lecture on the issue of coinage of terms that are used to describe refugees; contribution of refugees to the GDP of the host economy.
- 2. Photo exhibition and lecture on life in camps and how photographs and images have perspectivechanging impacts
- 3. Historical and political significance of discourses and reporting on migrants.
- 4. Representation of 'aliens' and 'intruders' in the framing of national policies.
- 5. How acceptance and cultural assimilation develops in case of particular communities while xenophobia, racism, denial and fear, create threat for other communities.
- 6. Local, national and international press on critical reporting and bias in case of migrant reporting. Media ethics, social media and migration could also be themes for lectures.
- 7. Reporting on citizenship act, migration and impact of social media's representation on migration research, and impact of online platforms and social media in helping share experiences and fostering bonds.

#### **Reflections on the discussion on Day 1**

• Names like Sharad Sharma - the leader of World Comics were listed and the role of commentaries on migration, labour and feminism was stressed.

• It was pointed out that participants during the field trips should be allotted slots to take interviews of migrants, which could be archived later. CRG could take up work on issues of citizenship and statelessness in terms of their influence on policy making.

# Day 2: 25 January 2020

## University and college teachers' workshop on syllabus making and expected output

- The possibilities of introduction of refugee and migration studies in the curriculum of colleges and universities were explored along with the involvement of policy-makers and ministries in the syllabus making process.
- Studies on rehabilitation schemes should incorporate interaction of students with affected communities, especially in case of border-states.
- Introduction of studies on the impact of climate change and cases of displacement with special reference to the coastal states of Odisha, Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu should be taken into account. Internal migration in the city of Mumbai, migration through sea route and from African and middle-east countries were outlined as possible areas of exploration.
- It was suggested that Mumbai University in collaboration with CRG could organise a public discussion on migrants and refugees, involving associations, universities, and other educational institutes. CRG could facilitate workshops in collaboration with universities as a general policy.
- Displacement, migration and refugee studies could be introduced as part of environmental studies for teaching at school, colleges, universities and law schools and the departments that provide media studies courses could also be involved. The framework for a 50 marks module on refugee studies with creative tools could be prepared by CRG and then initiated, formatted and taken up by universities.
- Preparation of model courses on refugee and migration studies especially at PG level through brain storming sessions with college and university faculty was discussed. The section with 20 per cent of syllabus allotted for elective courses could be marked out for migration and refugee studies; redrafting the existing related courses (such as global politics, international relations, environmental studies) with introduction of separate units on refugee studies as a part of these could also be thought of. Migration studies could also be considered as a part of the skill enhancement section of syllabus, especially for social science subjects.
- Involvement and participation of college teachers in CRG's migration workshop and conference was emphasised. It was recommended that reading lists be shared with colleges and universities for introducing the course. College clusters could create their own syllabi and have talks with state government regarding the introduction of a sub-discipline and initiation of course in college and university teaching. Workshops led by NCERT with participation from students, school and college teachers should be considered.

## **Publications**

- The publication proposal was being prepared as well as the final round of internal editing of the volume on protection was now on for submission to Orient Blackswan. The mss. will be sent to the publishers by June 2020, once the letter of acceptance comes in.
- By the middle of February 2020, Refugee Watch Issue 54 (December 2019) would be published; the June 2020 issue would have special section on migration, literature and gender. Another suggestion was to dedicate the issue on migration and NRC. The theme of refugee economy as an issue for Refugee Watch was also discussed probably Refugee Watch Issue 56 (December 2020).
- It was mentioned that the compilation of text books in vernacular languages by CRG for Undergraduate students of West Bengal should be important.
- The possibility of a compendium of case laws on issues of forced migration was discussed. Selected articles published in Policies and Practices could be integrated into a volume on a specific theme of research and translated into Bengali as reading material.
- Besides, the following ideas also suggested: (a) publication of migration maps on Refugeewatchonline; (b) Refugee calendar compilation that could highlight timeline of varied

occurrences, events, movements and laws and be priced by CRG; (c) Refugee film festival (South Asia) could be timed with the November workshop or during some other time of the year; (d) Publication of illustrated comics on refugees that could be used in schools. CRG could work on the journey of refugees through illustrations especially for school children to introduce them to the concept of migration and ground reality of crises faced by people on the move.

- Bharat Bhushan was invited to write an article on citizenship.
- IDP, Refugees and the State, and Statelessness could come together as a volume with Sage.
- The themes that could be worked out for the refugee law reader were (i) camps (ii) urban refugees (iii) land eviction and (iv) citizenship.
- Reprinting CRG's older editions currently out of print as well as updation of the Directory of Minority Rights available online were highlighted.

# Follow up measures (exchange visits and facilitating follow up work of selected participants)

Some of the prospects and possibilities of follow-up measures were enlisted as follows:

- Allotment of research assignments to three or four participants and researchers of past programmes and projects respectively. Field visits for researchers and exchange visits for college teachers.
- Organisation of two or three workshops in collaboration with partner organisations.
- Photo exhibition and film festival in Kolkata, Delhi, Mumbai, North-east.
- Comparison of the evolution of citizenship policies in Sri Lanka, Pakistan, India, Bangladesh. (Bharat Bhushan, Deepa Thapa and Hari Sharma could be approached to write on Nepal).
- Work on the regions of India that have been affected by ecological eviction like stretches of Gujarat, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Chhattisgarh or the Kosi flood affected Terai. In case of exchange programmes, comparisons could be drawn between Calcutta's and Dhaka's city planning, migration flows, issues of eviction and the displacement of fishing communities in coastal cities.
- Studies could be conducted on border hamlets (in the north and north-east) under shelling; registering shift of tribal populations along mountain and valley slopes, railway displacement in the Konkan coast, migration and public health, analysis of the reports of Sonali Bank and work on economic indicators like trade, formal and informal sectors.
- Young lawyers could be engaged to write commentaries from a South Asian perspective such as the research done by Simon Behrman. CRG's extensive study on Indian policies should be readdressed through the extension of policy studies.

## The tasks that would be followed up:

- A note to Oishik Sircar requesting him to share a revised write-up on the themes mentioned in the discussion session on refugee law reader like camps, urban refugees, land eviction, citizenship, in a month or two's time.
- Sabyasachi Basu Ray Chaudhury would submit a write-up on citizenship policies (by February 2020) and approach researchers for the volume on citizenship policies.
- Shibashish Chatterjee is expected to submit an 8000 words write-up on citizenship policies by May-June 2020.

## ANNEXURE

#### Participants' notes presented at the meeting

Marvi Slathia, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi and Workshop Participant, 2019

#### **Experience of Workshop and Conference, November 2019**

• The overall theme lectures delivered by the chairs, were quite insightful, covering the themes very well, both at theoretical and practical levels. Instead of paper presentations on all days, one day could be allotted exclusively for presentations by young scholars.

• The parallel sessions compelled the scholars to choose either one of the sessions. Single sessions at a time, would enable everyone to participate in all the sessions of the workshop and conference thus providing them with greater exposure and helping them learn more.

• Reading lists should be shared in advance based on the themes, which was observed in case of some lectures, after which tasks and practical work should be distributed in groups.

• The schedule could be framed in such a way that, there are two to three days of classes as well as activities, making the sessions more interactive; forms like presentations, paintings or theatre activities can be thought of. Although it is difficult to provide a definite plan of execution, such activities, if included, could help and open more options of learning during different sessions.

• The field work was very interesting and a great learning part of the workshop.

## This year theme/ New Areas

Taking into consideration the eruptions of discontent in the country, citizenship can become a larger area of exploration in the context of legal questions and the Constitution, especially the treatment met out to refugees. Social media is playing a vital role across the country during the social movements. The role of social media during movements can be looked into, in the context of refugees and citizenship questions.

#### Ranabir Samaddar, Calcutta Research Group, Kolkata

# Discussion note on Fifth Research and Orientation Workshop in Migration and Forced Migration Studies

This proposal aims to strengthen the structure of the ongoing programme in migration and forced migration studies, which has both research and orientation dimensions and has the following features: (a) a research segment whose findings will strengthen the programme; (b) four day workshop revolving around research papers on select themes of protection; (c) half a day field visit; (d) the workshop ending with a one day conference with experts, activists and policy makers addressing the main issues of protection; (e) a range of publications and visual products with the aim of wide publicity and dissemination of the results of the deliberations in the workshop and the conference; (f) public lectures in collaborations with universities, colleges and other institutions and dialogues held in collaboration with various public forums in different cities of India; (g) a workshop of college and university teachers on syllabus and curriculum making; (h) and a media workshop. These will be relevant to the task of strengthening the fund of knowledge on migration and forced migration, policy deliberations on these issues, the networks of activists and researchers working in this area, and finally dissemination.

The programme is built on the continuity of the theme of global protection. Yet the crucial issue will be: What has changed in the landscape of protection in the past few years? Have the fault lines and the crisis in the protection mechanisms become more acute? Are there new issues to be discussed and deliberated upon? In other words, while the programme will be based on the continued relevance of the theme of global protection, it will have to demonstrate alertness to new issues. Thus, while the fifth research and orientation workshop will be built on the essentials of the previous workshops, in particular the third and the fourth, it will also bring to discussion the new features of the situation in

the global and regional situations of migration and forced migration requiring new strategies of protection.

In view of the increasing conceptual breadth and theoretical sophistication of migration and forced migration scholarship, historic knowledge of patterns and forms of mobility is even more important. Contemporary migration scholarship is still deficient in historical awareness and hence unable to bring out the political and economic truths. Notwithstanding the wide range of research methodologies, and reflections on the diverse sites and subjects of migration, we lack the focus that can produce a compelling critique of conventional knowledge of migration. In the rich array of methods (quantitative, computational, qualitative, mixed-method, scalar, social network-centric, ethnographic, life-story-oriented, participatory, and visual documentation and visualization approaches and techniques) the neglect of history is pronounced. Therefore in spite of the rich methodological developments the field fails to fully explore and interrogate the realities of migration and forced migration that overwhelm our time. We need contextually grounded research yet critical in conceptual treatment. Thus new pedagogic basis must address the concerns, such as: (a) How do we research new space making practices and temporalities at various levels (global, regional, national, local, etc.) caused or influenced by migration and forced migration? (b) Related to this, how do we map migrations over time and space? (c) What kinds of methodological approaches to seriously contemplate multi-sited research and develop networks of scholarship, in short transform our academic engagement from individual or group scholarship to a platform mode of investigation and cognition? (d) How to enable migration scholarship for the task of boundary-crossing? (e) Finally, how to devise knowledge practices that can be mobilised against institutionalized practices reproducing racism, patriarchy, and forms of global domination, and pave the way for a critical approach in our migration research that can open up new imaginations of a political society?

Another point to note: How to expand the ambit of the programme, yet keep the focus on the theme of protection? At one level, we may redesign the sub-themes partially to engage with the question of "migration and politics" through research papers and workshop module topics. However we have to maintain the focus on protection. This is a paradoxical task. But given the changing realities, this is the best conceptual template of the programme. This also means combining "global outlook with local experiences" – both for understanding the interface of the issue of migration and democracy and politics in general, and the complexities involved in the notion of protection. To collectively deliberate on this question, one crucial theme requiring attention is the dynamics of migration as a theme in politics, government, and population management. To embark on such a critical venture is to elevate the quality of the programme, make it more rigorous, and focused.

One significant dimension of the programme is the expansion of collaborative network. It would mean strengthening the collaborative framework with participation from South Asia (including India), South East Asia, Middle East, Turkey and other West Asian countries. The other important attempt of the programme will be to foster exchanges of knowledge and ideas between Europe and Asia on issues of war, refugee crisis, migration and forced migration, with comparison and sharing of research experiences among researchers of Europe and Asia; such as the refugee crises of Bay of Bengal and the Mediterranean.

Finally, in view of ongoing developments, the outcome of the programme has to be more diversified. Currently the outcome is mainly in the form of research-based papers, articles and reports for media, and visual products on a small scale. It is understandable that CRG as a critical research collective will bring out research products. However, the deliverables can be more imaginative – like television discussions, a legal compendium, specifically commissioned reports to be used as primary material, small scale dialogues, and other components coming out of follow up activities (mentioned earlier). Both digital and arts and humanities based approaches can be deployed in planning the outcomes. Thus, along with research based writings, publications, and orientation activity, the programme will aim to have more diverse components and results, such as: migration maps, various digital outputs, a reader in South Asian refugee law, media inputs, and visual and audio products. Public campaigns and publicity measures have been satisfactory. The task is, how to take these forward without jeopardising the standard and continuity of the programme?

#### V Ramaswamy, Calcutta Research Group, Kolkata

## Field Visit

The field-visit is not a sight-seeing tour. Nor is it 'poverty tourism'. It is about learning, through linkage, participation, solidarity and most importantly, dialogue which cuts across unbridgeable boundaries. The field-visit to Priya Manna Basti, Howrah, in 2019 may be taken as a case in point.

In Priya Manna Basti, there is a 20+ year old grassroots organisation led by women, belonging to the religious minority Muslim community, as well as the linguistic minority Urdu community. This is a century-old, jute-workers' settlement, where today – following more than four decades of deindustrialisation in the former industrial hub city of Howrah; after the closure of Howrah Jute Mills, which used to be the employer of most adult males in the community; with de-industrialisation having been accompanied by real estate forces, as mill lands were converted to residential estates and shopping malls; and finally, the emergence of BJP and Hindutwa, represented on the ground by the Hindi-speaking and Marwari population who surround this basti; – the community may be seen to be living under extreme vulnerability, over and above the ever-present economic, social, environmental and consequent health vulnerability.

Yet, in Priya Manna Basti there is an organisation, HPP, which was established in 1997 (by none other than a CRG member himself), with the objective of initiating a long-term community empowerment programme, focussed on poor women and children, and their education and health. Through its work, the organisation has built awareness, capabilities and leadership for community development. In essence, HPP is different from a typical NGO. There is no external element in the organisation, the ownership is entirely from within the community. The founder undertook to mentor educated volunteers from the community, and especially women, and then transferred ownership to them, challenging them to learn through action and experience. The organisation and its members have built immense 'soft power' in the neighbourhood - for instance, by having nurtured with their own hands and educated thousands of children, who now form the youth and adult population.

A field-visit, or a linkage, with such an organisation, given its situational context – is a very valuable, enriching, educative, communicational experience for the serious learner. The participant has to 'hear', and the participant can engage in genuine 'dialogue' – because notwithstanding the immense economic, social, cultural, religious gulf between the visitor and the community-member, at that moment, in the place, there exists a horizontality, of being at the same level, being equal, as a human being, with goodwill and conviviality for the other. That special space has been created inside the modest premises of HPP, in which the hierarchies of the 'real world' are held in abeyance, and a 'refraction' takes place, producing a space where humanity, equality, integrity, mutual respect and goodwill, learning and dialogue prevails.

The town planner, Patrick Geddes, had conceived of the 'outlook tower', a structure and space from where planning for the city and its bio-region could take place. HPP is like an outlook tower, for learning – through community development-related action on the ground – about urban poverty and vulnerability, and community empowerment. For the anti-thesis of poverty is empowerment. HPP is a live laboratory, and its members represent two decades of experiential self-growth to leadership.

Coming back to the field-visit module -a 'match-making' exercise could be considered, whereby course participants come with an interest in particular questions, issues or dimensions that manifest in the Priya Manna Basti context; so that a real dialogue can take place.

Finally, the HPP founder, is an exceptional communicator and translator, would facilitate the dialogue.

## Aditi Mukherjee, Calcutta Research Group, Kolkata

## Field visit as part of winter workshop - A Note

As a participant in CRG's winter course I have participated in two field visits for two consecutive courses. These have been half a day field visit from afternoon to evening followed by dinner. In 2018 there were two parallel field visits. The first trip was to settlements of Calcutta's old cosmopolitan migrants concentrated in parts of west and central Calcutta. It included a visit to the Posta Bazar, Burra Bazar, Magen David Synagogue, Beth El Synagogue, Armenian Church, the Grand Hotel and New Market area.

The second trip was to the quarters of Calcutta's more recent labour migrants. There was a visit to the Bantala Leather Complex in the East Calcutta Wetlands and a visit to the Khidirpur Docks, where there was an interaction with Muslim labour migrants who work in the dock area.

In 2019 there were two parallel field visits, both to the labour migrant quarters. The first trip was to the Metiabruz area. It included a tour around Suriname ghat, which was a point of departure for India's indentured labour migrants (from Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and Bengal) to Suriname during the late 19th and early 20th century (to work as labourers in sugarcane plantations). Participants toured around the neighbourhood of Metiabruz. This was followed by a session of detailed interaction with community members taking place inside an Imambara, facilitated by Know Your Neighbour. This trip was coordinated by Sabir Ahamed, a member of the Calcutta Research Group.

The second trip included a visit to a slum in Howrah called the Priya Manna Bustee, which came into existence as a labour migrant quarter and supplied labour to then flourishing jute mills in the surrounding areas. Here the workshop participants engaged in an indoor interaction with the inhabitants of the bustee. This trip was coordinated by V Ramaswamy, a member of the Calcutta Research Group.

This year we have prepared two brief textual reports out of the field visit. The nature of the engagement can be made more intense, by increasing the duration of the visit. Along with textual reports, visual method can be used more centrally, with consent of community members, to document stories of the community members. If multiple visits are organised through the year, there can be a dedicated facebook page linked to CRG's main facebook page to share the various contents of CRG's field visits.

## Ria De, Research and Programme Associate, Calcutta Research Group

#### **Creative Media Activities**

1. 1-3 short documentary film(s) to be produced and released by Calcutta Research Group. A Call for proposals on the basis of this year's themes will be circulated. 5-10 young filmmakers will be selected on the basis of their experience and skills, and novelty of approach. A 1-2 day workshop will be organized by CRG to orient the filmmakers on the ongoing research project and to receive inputs on the film form and narrative. The workshop will conclude with final proposal submissions from the participants, based on which a final selection of 1-3 filmmakers will be done. They will be allotted a time period of 6 months, during which they are to submit three drafts of their work; a rough cut, first cut and a final cut: to be released in an event by Calcutta Research Group.

2. Photographic and video documentation of the ongoing movement from across the country; protest sites such as Shaheen Bagh, Park Circus, Jama Masjid, placards, posters slogans, flags etc.

3. Since most mainstream images of the ongoing issue are either city-centric or are produced through urban intervention, it would be important to undertake a field-work intensive documentation and compilation of videos and photographs produced and circulated within rural social media networks such as whatsapp. These would include images and narratives that non-urban people are producing through technologies that they own (such as camera-enabled smart phones). This part of the project can be limited to Bengal as a site of research and will benefit from the massive inflation of images on social media that is a "natural" condition of an ongoing movement.

#### Event

A half-day event including the release and screening of the films along with a multi-media installation of the photo and video documentation compiled over six months.

#### Paula Banerjee, Calcutta Research Group and University of Calcutta

#### An edited volume on protection

In the summer of 2015, commonly referred to as the 'summer of migration', a supposed 'European refugee crisis' was said to have unfurled both within and outside Europe receiving refugee flows from war torn Syria. It generated a perception of a worldwide refugee 'crisis' and created a context for revisiting the global protection mechanism for refugees and migrants as enshrined in the UN refugee conventions. Under the aegis of UNHCR, two new global compacts, a Global Compact on Refugees and a Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration were signed in 2018. The

global compacts give rise to new questions regarding the idea of 'protection' enshrined in them. In this context the Calcutta Research Group organised a workshop and conference on the *Global Protection System for Refugees and Migrants*, 25-30 November 2018 held in Kolkata. Drawing on select research papers presented in the workshop and conference, an edited volume around the theme of protection of refugees and migrants is planned, to be published by Orient Blackswan. The volume aims to problematise the idea of protection from different angles. The essays in the volume are arranged around three conceptual cores: new technologies of governing migratory flows; the fault lines of race, religion, gender in the protection regime; and neoliberalism and immigrant economies.

The first set of essays by Bandana Purkayastha, Federico Rahola, Anita Sengupta and Priya Singh deal with innovative technologies of migration governance, aimed at governing from a distance. All four essays trace how transformations in regional geopolitics generates mixed and massive population flows that the protection regimes often fail to address and point to the uneven geography of protection. These essays draw attention to newly emerging and technologically advanced bordering strategies, such as offshore detention techniques and hotspots (Federico Rahola, Bandana Purkayastha). The essay by Sabyasachi Basu Ray Chaudhury also points to increasing statelessness resulting from skewed protection policies. However one point of emphasis remains that the current migration movements and practices in some exceed the regulatory capacities of governance. Migrants in turn create their own 'underground cartographies' of counter-conducts attempting to challenge the exclusionary protection regimes.

In delineating the integral connection between protracted dislocations in the global south and asylum policies in the countries of the north and in highlighting the global imbalances in responsibility sharing between powerful western nations and the post colonial counterparts, the volume places an ethical question. Should protection regimes be premised on principles of humanitarianism with implicit assumptions of care and hospitality or should it ultimately be a question of rights?

Another set of essays trace how conditions of protracted forced displacements are entwined with the global mechanisms of neoliberal capitalism. Byasdeb Dasgupta highlights how cheap labour of refugees and migrants fuels neoliberal global capitalism. The chapter notes that refugee protection has become an affair of technocratic management which is oriented towards the necessities of the market and development goals. As refugees have been transformed from subjects of protection to subjects of neoliberal development (Samaddar 2019), concerns about their welfare have declined.

Finally Paula Banerjee's essay points to the fault lines of the protection regime along the lines of race, religion and gender which also reflects in hierarchised citizenship regimes worldwide. Her chapter foregrounds the role of gender as an unspoken fourth axis of differentiation in the protection regime. Ilina Sen's chapter highlight the conditions of Asian female migrants who work as domestic workers in the Gulf region and the gendered nature of violence routinely experienced by them. **Chapters:** 

- 1. Bandana Purkayastha, Distancing as Governance: Reflections on Migrants and Contemporary (in) Securities
- 2. Anita Sengupta, Migrants and Movements across Asia: Mobility, Global Migration Governance, and the European Response
- 3. Federico Rahola, the Leash and the Rip: Struggles and Conflicts Beneath Migrants' and Asylum Seekers' "Secondary Movements"
- 4. Priya Singh, Reframing the Refugee Crisis: Resistances and Solidarities
- 5. Shibashis Chatterjee, Population Flows, Refugees, and the Responsibility to Protect in the Global Protection System
- 6. Sabyasachi Basu Ray Chaudhury, Statelessness, International Conventions and the Need for New Initiatives? Addressing the New Frontiers of Statelessness
- 7. Byasdeb Dasgupta, Refugee Economy An Inside of Global Capitalism
- 8. Ilina Sen, Challenges Faced by Asian Women Domestic Workers in the Gulf: A Comparison of Experiences from South India (Kerala), Sri Lanka, and the Philippines
- 9. Paula Banerjee, Responsibility to Protect: Questions of Race, Religion, Resource and the Unspoken Fourth

## Samata Biswas, Calcutta Research Group and Sanskrit College and University, Kolkata

**Refugee Watch Online** is currently a blog, soon to be a website that hosts popular and semi academic articles, opinion pieces, photo essays, reviews, commentaries and reports related to the field of Migration and Forced Migration studies. There are three different ways that RWO content is disseminated: once the content has been uploaded to the website, it is shared on the website's Facebook page, on its twitter account and a month's publications are sent to concerned people as an email link.

In the past, RWO has regularly uploaded reports of conferences and workshops organised by CRG as well has reports of other events attended by different participants. RWO has the potential of serving as a one-stop platform for much of the media requirements for CRG's forthcoming workshop on Forced Migration.

Moreover, participants in the annual workshop regularly send in their shorter pieces to RWO, thereby building and fostering a network of scholars and activists. For the annual research workshop and conference, two or three media interns can be recruited (ideally post graduate or later students who would be given a certificate for their involvement—a small per diem to cover their travel and refreshment and conference kit) who could write short reports of the day's proceedings, post photos and snippets of videos, interesting claims and quotations on the different social media accounts associated with RWO and one or two minutes' long video interviews with the participants, on the most pressing concerns in the contemporary world. (These would be different from the long interviews that CRG typically undertakes—and be uploaded immediately from smart phones).

The RWO could also serve as a repository for interesting profiles of the participants and digitally host the forced migration exhibition/ display that has been discussed for a long time now (this involves requesting the participants to bring an object associated with migration to the workshop—either in its tangible form or digital form, and explain its significance).

[Refugee Watch Online - Currently hosted at refugeewatchonline.wordpress.com

Formerly hosted at refugeewatchonline, blogspot.com

To be shifted to refugeewatch.org.in]

## Subir Bhaumik, Eminent Journalist and Member, Calcutta Research Group, Kolkata

The segment should focus on how media covers migration and minority issues as migrants are invariably minorities.

There should be focus on (a) popular attitudes on migration and how it has been reflected in media (b) whether the media has been open to a counter narrative like Microsoft CEO Satya Nadella 's expressed desire that a Bangladeshi should one day head Infosys (c) looking into the priorities and the space given by media to migrant and minority issues (d) representation in terms of the extent to which minority or migrant representation is seen in media coverage (for e.g. - in US, whether a man of Indian origin could head New York Times or Washington Post like Nadella heads Microsoft or Pichai is heading Google).

The discussion should specially focus on NRC- CAA debate and how migration and minority issues have taken the hot seat in Indian politics post Modi and how it creates an impact on the idea of India as people have known it, with special focus on Assam.

## Bharat Bhushan, Eminent Journalist, New Delhi

## Draft note on the media module

1. **Introductory lecture**: Why do journalists need to be trained to report on migration -- To counter political rhetoric and intolerance, contextualising migration, going beyond the migrants as threats or victims and going beyond overly sentimental stories of suffering, detention centres and migrant camps.

2. **Representation of migrants in the media**: This could be a set of two lectures —one on text and the other on images.

a. The first could deal with importance of terminology and descriptors in reporting on migrants (Refugee/Migrant/Illegal Immigrant/ Infiltrators/Asylum Seekers/Termites etc.)

b. The second lecture could be by a photojournalist who has worked on migrants or with migrants about the images and their significance in describing the migrants (e.g. the impact of the picture of a drowned Syrian Kurdish three-and-a-half-year old Alan/Aylan Kurdi on attitude to Syrian migrants in Europe and in Canada, pictures of Rohingya refugees marching through terrible rain through Teknaf in Bangladesh with luggage on their heads and children in tow, etc.).

3. **Historical context and national context in reporting on migrants** and its impact on reportage on migration. Has a country or region been affected severely by migration/infiltration/illegal immigrants in the past? And what bearing does that have on how they view 'outsiders'?

4. **State pressure on migration reporting.** How do national policy and social discourse determine journalistic reporting on migration? And how are national policies and social discourses themselves determined?

5. **Differential treatment of different migrants:** Why do nation states treat different categories of migrants differently? Why are Tibetan refugees accepted in India and the Dalai Lama revered or why are Nepalese Hindus not seen as an immigration threat but Bangladeshi Muslims are? This lecture could discuss racist, religious and cultural considerations in acceptance or rejection of migrants.

6. **Difference between local and national press on migration reportage**: Local media from the sites of first encounter between migrants and locals may report the migrants very differently than the media far removed from the site. The reasons for difference in reportage (e.g. Cox's Bazar based media vs. Dhaka media vs. international media on Rohingya refugees; Assamese media vs. other Indian media reportage on Bangladeshi migrant problem). How do local reporters (and reportage) pressure national media e.g. preparing defamatory dossiers about representatives of national press who report differently and designating them 'anti-national'? The dossier prepared by Assamese media about so called 'anti-national' reporters based in Guwahati could be discussed, in this context.

7. **Practical exercise**: Analysing a selection of reports on the NRC and detention centres in the Assamese media and the national press. Another exercise could be on the polarisation in the media on the Citizenship Amendment Act.

## Rajat Roy, Calcutta Research Group, Kolkata

Following are some of the steps that should be considered for our media related project:

1. We need to prepare a Handbook on Refugees and Migrants in India. This should consist of relevant laws and conventions that are there for the protection of the Refugees and the Migrants. There should be a fact sheet or data relevant for the issues of Refugees and Migrants. The Handbook should be made available digitally, so that it can be updated periodically.

2. A series of web discussion should be prepared on the issues crucial to the subject of Refugees and Migrants. These discussions should be prepared by involving senior researchers and experts in the respective subjects. Instead of covering the entire gamut of the issues, each of the topics for discussion should be focussed on a single issue. The duration of the discussion should be around 10-15 minutes. We should plan to have at least one discussion in each month, thereby producing at least 12 such video recordings in a year. We should collate news, editorials, and opinion pieces from print and electronic media and continue to build on that.

3. All these (1-3) should be uploaded in a separate platform, e.g., Media on Refugees and Migrants, with a direct link uploaded to the CRG website.

4. Besides that, we need to explore ways of encouraging TV channels and web portals to have discussions on such topics involving experts from CRG.

5. Since, we need to sensitise media on these issues, we will have to explore ways of initiating dialogue with senior journalists and editors more. For that, meetings with journalists individually and in group should be arranged.

6. To achieve all that, we should focus more on Digital Platforms and various web portals.

Shibashish Chatterjee, Department of International Relations, Jadavpur University

#### University and college teachers' workshop on syllabus making and expected output

Most universities and both affiliated and autonomous colleges of West Bengal are now guided by the Choice Based Credit System (CBCS) that has largely streamlined the syllabi across social science

disciplines. While there is some variation over particular courses offered and the combinations available, the flexibility and autonomy that universities enjoyed in the past over the drafting of syllabus is now lost. However, within the existing parameters, three aspects loom large and deserve attention. First, there remains scope for the introduction of optional courses that can be offered by departments but open to students across disciplinary frontiers. Secondly, under the new structure, there is significant scope to conceive inter-disciplinary courses that would be relevant to students across disciplines. Thirdly, many new courses and topics incorporated within the syllabus are poorly referenced or over referenced and teachers find it difficult to frame an adequate pedagogical strategy to perform their tasks effectively. CRG can think of a session, as part of its Workshop, devoted to the discussion of syllabi for programmes of studies in political science and history that contain courses on world politics, migration and refugee issues, international political economy, and gender, among many others. The session may be modelled either on open discussions on specific courses or on framing new courses that are inter-disciplinary, theoretically challenging, policy relevant, and in line with the research agenda of CRG. Most syllabus workshops are vertical exercises where University faculty address issues pertaining to College teaching. While this is necessary and has some manifest efficacy in tackling the challenges, the inputs are often difficult to internalise and the ground reality faced by the teachers may not enable them to implement these suggestions productively. Instead of vertical exercises, a workshop on syllabus should be based on open discussions of all stakeholders (among the teaching community) and identify a clear-headed strategy to introduce meaningful and interesting courses and resolve pedagogical issues within the broad existing structure. Such inputs would go a long way to address the deficiencies in the system and involve the teachers more directly so that they can teach and guide students more self-assuredly. More than anything else, it would immensely help improve the prevailing course contents and contribute to the overall academic betterment across educational institutions.

# Sabyasachi Basu Ray Chaudhury, Calcutta Research Group and Rabindra Bharati University, Kolkata

## The follow-up activities

In the follow-up segment, Mahanirban Calcutta Research Group (CRG) is supposed to facilitate research and other assignments of the participants. Therefore, the CRG will select one researcher each from Bangladesh, Nepal, Sri Lanka and Afghanistan from amongst the participants of the CRG's last Annual Research and Orientation workshop on Refugees and Migrants: Issues of Protection, Rights and Justice (25-29 November 2019). Similarly, two or three past participants of the same workshop will be selected from India and will be requested to conduct research, conducting investigative research in their own areas. The CRG will also organise at least two and if possible three workshops, this year in collaboration with its partner institutions on the basis of resource or cost sharing on the theme of migration and forced migration. The CRG has a plan to undertake assignments like creative reporting by media persons and human rights activists on the same broad theme. Likewise, CRG has a plan to organise exchange programmes on a small scale involving a few teachers, students and activists within South Asia in order to familiarise and sensitise them with the contemporary developments in the area of migration and forced migration and for learning from them their experiences while working on these issues. The outcomes of the Annual Research and Orientation Workshop along with the publications based on research by the participants and the fresh ideas generated through the exchange programmes will be disseminated through different means, and if possible through incorporation of some of these ideas into the curricula of relevant courses in different universities. The proposed follow-up activities may thus help broaden the reach of the CRG's flagship programme, strengthen the network on migration and forced migration and underpin collaboration with the universities and other academic institutions.